ENS Statelessness Index Survey: Bulgaria



Contents

| Contents | |
|--|----|
| International and Regional Instruments | |
| 1954 Convention | 3 |
| 1961 Convention | 4 |
| Other conventions | |
| Stateless Population Data | 8 |
| Availability and sources | 8 |
| Stateless in detention data | 12 |
| Statelessness Determination and Status | 14 |
| Definition of a stateless person | 14 |
| Existence of a dedicated SDP | |
| Access to procedure (SDP) | 16 |
| Assessment (SDP) | |
| Procedural Protections (SDP) | 24 |
| Protection during SDP | 27 |
| Appeals (SDP) | 29 |
| Stateless Status (SDP) | 30 |
| Access to citizenship (SDP) | 35 |
| Detention | 39 |
| Detention screening | 39 |

© 2019 European Network on Statelessness. All rights reserved. This country survey is not intended for wider dissemination as a standalone document, and should be read in conjunction with (and any reference made to) the Statelessness Index country profile on <u>Bulgaria</u>; February 2019. The research for this survey was carried out by Valeria Ilareva (Foundation for Access to Rights) with input from UNHCR Bulgaria as second country experts.

| | Alternatives to immigration detention | 43 |
|----|---------------------------------------|----|
| | Procedural safeguards | |
| | Protections on release | 52 |
| | Readmission agreements | 53 |
| P | evention and Reduction | 55 |
| | Stateless born on territory | 55 |
| | Foundlings | |
| | Adoption | 62 |
| | lus sanguinis and discrimination | 63 |
| | Access to birth registration | 64 |
| | Late Birth Registration | 67 |
| | Reduction | |
| | Withdrawal of nationality | 69 |
| Ju | risprudence and Training | 71 |
| | Published judgements | 71 |
| | Legal training | |
| | Pro Bono | 73 |
| | Literature | 72 |

International and Regional Instruments

| Cat | Q | Sub | Subtheme | Question | International Norms / Good Practice | Answer | Source |
|-----|---|-----|--------------------|---|---|--------|---|
| IOB | 1 | a | 1954 Convention | Is your country party to the 1954 Statelessness Convention? | UN Convention Relating to the Status of Stateless Persons, 1954 | Yes | UN Treaties Database, https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetailsII.aspx? https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetailsII.aspx? <a const"="" en="" href="mailto:src=IND&mtdsg_no=V-3&chapter=5&Temp=mtdsg_no=V-3&chapter=5&Temp=mtdsg_no=V-3&chapter=5&Temp=mtdsg_no=V-3&chapter=5&Temp=mtdsg_no=V-3&chapter=5&Temp=mtdsg_no=V-3&chapter=5&Temp=mtdsg_no=V-3&chapter=5&Temp=mtdsg_no=V-3&chapter=5&Temp=mtdsg_no=V-3&chapter=5&Temp=mtdsg_no=V-3&chapter=5&Temp=mtdsg_no=V-3&chapter=5&Temp=mtdsg_no=V-3&chapter=5&Temp=mtdsg_no=</td></tr><tr><td>ЮВ</td><td>1</td><td>b</td><td></td><td>If yes, when was ratification/acc ession?</td><td></td><td>Bulgaria ratified the 1954 Convention by law promulgated in the State Gazette on 7 February 2012.</td><td>State Gazette of the Republic of Bulgaria No 11 of 7 February 2012, http://dv.parliament.bg/DVWeb/showMaterialDV.jsp?idMat=60939 (B)</td></tr><tr><td>ЮВ</td><td>1</td><td>С</td><td></td><td>Are there reservations in place? Please list them.</td><td>Best practice is no reservations. If there are, they should have little or no effect on the rights of stateless persons.</td><td>Yes, Bulgaria has made reservations to: • Article 7, paragraph 2 (exemption from reciprocity), • Article 21 (housing), • Article 23 (public relief), • Article 24, paragraph 1 (b) (social security), • Article 24, paragraph 2 (right to compensation for the death of a stateless person resulting from employment injury or from occupational disease), • Article 24, Paragraph 3 (extension to stateless persons of the benefits of agreements concluded between the contracting states), • Article 27 (identity papers), • Article 28 (travel documents), and • Article 31 (expulsion).</td><td>UN Treaties Database, https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetailsII.aspx? src=IND&mtdsg no=V- 3&chapter=5&Temp=mtdsg2&clang= en#EndDe c</td></tr><tr><td>IOB</td><td>1</td><td>d</td><td></td><td>Does Convention have direct effect?</td><td>Best practice is that the Convention has direct effect, though this may depend on legal regime.</td><td>Yes. According to Article 5(4) of the Constitution of the Republic of Bulgaria, international treaties that have been ratified, promulgated and have entered</td><td>Article 5 (4), Constitution of the Republic of Bulgaria, http://www.parliament.bg/en/const |

| IOB | 2 | а | 1961 Convention | Is your country party to the 1961 Statelessness Convention? | UN Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, 1961 | into force for the Republic of Bulgaria, are part of the domestic law of the country and take precedence over contradicting domestic legislation. Yes. | UN Treaties Database, https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?s rc=IND&mtdsg_no=V-4&chapter=5&clang=_en |
|-----|---|---|----------------------|--|---|---|--|
| IOB | 2 | b | | If yes, when was ratification/acc ession? | | The ratification law was promulgated on 7 February 2012. | State Gazette No 11 of 7 February 2012, http://dv.parliament.bg/DVWeb/showMaterialDV.jsp?idMat=60939 (B) |
| ЮВ | 2 | С | | Are there reservations in place? Please list them. | As above | No | UN Treaties Database, https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?s rc=IND&mtdsg_no=V-4&chapter=5&clang=_en |
| ЮВ | 2 | d | | Does Convention have direct effect? | As above | Yes | Article 5(4) of the Constitution of the Republic of Bulgaria, http://www.parliament.bg/en/const |
| IOB | 3 | a | Other conventions | State party to European Convention on Nationality 1997? Are there reservations in place? Please list them. | European Convention on Nationality, 1997 | Yes. Bulgaria has made reservations to Article 11 (Decisions); Article 12 (Right to a review); Article 16 (Conservation of previous nationality); and Article 17(1) (Rights and duties related to multiple nationality) | Council of Europe, Chart of signatures and ratifications of Treaty 166, https://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/full-list//conventions/treaty/166/signatures?p auth= cuii0yaM |
| IOB | 3 | b | | State Party to European Convention on Human Rights 1950? Are there reservations in | European Convention on Human Rights, 1950 | Yes. There are no reservations in place. | Council of Europe, Chart of signatures and ratifications of Treaty 005, https://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/full-list//conventions/treaty/005/signatures?p-auth=zpmyziim |

| | | | place? Please list them. | | | |
|-----|---|---|---|---|--|--|
| ЮВ | 3 | С | State Party to Council of Europe Convent ion on the avoidance of statelessness in relation to State succession 2006? Are there reservations in place? Please | Council of Europe Convention on the Avoidance of Statelessness in Relation to State Succession, 2006 | No | Council of Europe, Chart of signatures and ratifications of Treaty 200, https://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/full- list//conventions/treaty/200/signatures?p auth= zPMYZIIM |
| IOB | 3 | d | list them. Bound by Directive 2008/115/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council (EU Returns Directive). Are there reservations in place? Please list them. | Directive 2008/115/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council (EU Returns Directive) | Yes, Bulgaria is an EU Member State and has no reservations. | EU member countries in brief, https://europa.eu/european-union/about- eu/countries/member-countries/bulgaria en |
| ЮВ | 3 | е | State Party to Convention on the Rights of the Child 1989? Are there reservations in place? Please list them. | Convention on the Rights of the Child 1989 | Yes. No reservations. | UN Treaties Database, https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?s rc=IND&mtdsg no=IV-11&chapter=4&clang= en |

5

| | | | ı | Chata Danta L | International Comment | V N | LINI Toosking Database |
|-----|---|---|---|------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------|--|
| | | | | State Party to | International Covenant on | Yes. No reservations. | UN Treaties Database, |
| | | | | International | Civil and Political Rights 1966 | | https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?s |
| | | | | Covenant on | | | rc=IND&mtdsg_no=IV-5&chapter=4&clang=_en |
| | | | | Civil and | | | |
| IOB | 3 | f | | Political Rights | | | |
| | | | | 1966? Are | | | |
| | | | | there | | | |
| | | | | reservations in | | | |
| | | | | place? Please | | | |
| | | | | list them. | | | |
| | | | | State Party to | International Covenant on | Yes. No reservations. | UN Treaties Database, |
| | | | | International | Economic, Social and Cultural | | https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?s |
| | | | | Covenant on | <u>Rights 1966</u> | | rc=IND&mtdsg_no=IV- |
| | | | | Economic, | | | 3&chapter=4&clang=_en#EndDec |
| | | | | Social and | | | |
| IOB | 3 | g | | Cultural Rights | | | |
| | | | | 1966? Are | | | |
| | | | | there | | | |
| | | | | reservations in | | | |
| | | | | place? Please | | | |
| | | | | list them. | | | |
| | | | | State Party to | Convention on the Elimination | Yes. No reservations. | UN Treaties Database, |
| | | | | Convention on | of all Forms of Discrimination | | https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src |
| | | | | the Elimination | Against Women 1979 | | =IND&mtdsg_no=IV- |
| | | | | of all Forms of | Gen. Rec. 32 on the gender- | | 8&chapter=4&clang=_en#9 |
| | | | | Discrimination | related dimensions of refugee | | |
| IOB | 3 | h | | Against Women | status, asylum, nationality and | | |
| | | | | 1979? Are | statelessness. | | |
| | | | | there | | | |
| | | | | reservations in | | | |
| | | | | place? Please | | | |
| | | | | list them. | | | |
| | | | | State Party to | Convention against Torture | Yes. No reservations. | UN Treaties Database, |
| | | | | Convention | and Other Cruel, Inhuman or | | https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?s |
| IOB | 3 | i | | against Torture | Degrading Treatment or | | rc=IND&mtdsg_no=IV- |
| IOB | 3 | ' | | and Other | Punishment 1984 | | 9&chapter=4&clang= en#18 |
| | | | | Cruel, Inhuman | | | |
| | | | | or Degrading | | | |

^{© 2019} European Network on Statelessness. All rights reserved. This country survey is not intended for wider dissemination as a standalone document, and should be read in conjunction with (and any reference made to) the Statelessness Index country profile on <u>Bulgaria</u>; February 2019

| | | | Treatment or | | | |
|-----|---|---|--------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------|--|
| | | | Punishment | | | |
| | | | 1984? Are | | | |
| | | | there | | | |
| | | | reservations in | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | place? Please list them. | | | |
| | | | | International Communication on | V N | LINI Transition Details and |
| | | | State Party to | International Convention on | Yes. No reservations. | UN Treaties Database, |
| | | | International | the Elimination of All Forms of | | https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?s |
| | | | Convention on | Racial Discrimination 1965 | | rc=IND&mtdsg no=IV- |
| | | | the Elimination | | | 2&chapter=4&clang= en#EndDec |
| | | | of All Forms of | | | |
| IOB | 3 | j | Racial | | | |
| 100 | | , | Discrimination | | | |
| | | | 1966? Are | | | |
| | | | there | | | |
| | | | reservations in | | | |
| | | | place? Please | | | |
| | | | list them. | | | |
| | | | State Party to | International Convention on | No. | UN Treaties Database, |
| | | | the | the Protection of the Rights of | | https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?s |
| | | | International | all Migrant Workers and | | rc=IND&mtdsg_no=IV-13&chapter=4&clang=_en |
| | | | Convention on | Members of their Families | | |
| | | | the Protection | <u>1990</u> | | |
| | | | of the Rights of | | | |
| | | | All Migrant | | | |
| IOB | 3 | k | Workers and | | | |
| | | | Members of | | | |
| | | | their Families | | | |
| | | | 1990? Are | | | |
| 1 | | | there | | | |
| | | | reservations in | | | |
| | | | place? Please | | | |
| 1 | | | list them. | | | |

Stateless Population Data

| Cat | Q | Sub | Subtheme | Question | International Norms / Good Practice | Answer | Source |
|-----|---|-----|--------------------------------|---|--|---|---|
| POP | 1 | а | Availability and sources | Does the Govt have a discrete category for statelessness in its data collection system (e.g. in the census)? If so, what are the Govt figures for the total stateless population on the territory? Is the data disaggregated? If so, how? | ● Gen. Rec. 32 of CEDAW (para. 39): States parties should gather, analyse and make available sex- disaggregated statistical data and trends ● European Council, Conclusions of the Council and the Representatives of the Governments of the Member States on Statelessness: Recognise the importance of exchanging good practicesconcerning the collection of reliable data on stateless persons ● UNHCR Global Action Plan to End Statelessness 2014- 2024 (Action 10): Improve quantitative and qualitative data on stateless populations ● Institute on Statelessness and Inclusion (The World's Stateless) pg.11: States should adopt and/or strengthen measures to count stateless persons on their territory | There is no specific category on stateless persons in the census and there is no centralised figure on the total stateless population in Bulgaria. Miscellaneous pieces of data on stateless persons can be found in data gathered by the Ministry of the Interior, the State Agency for Refugees and the Ministry of Justice. The National Statistical Institute has published data on "international migration" in Bulgaria concerning immigrants and emigrants. The number of immigrants is divided into Bulgarian nationals and other nationals. The data on other nationals and non-EU nationals. The statistical data on non-EU nationals includes aggregate data on "third country nationals, stateless persons and unknown citizenship". The Migration Directorate at the Ministry of the Interior gathers data on the number of lawful residents: persons who were granted stateless status and stateless persons or 'persons with unknown citizenship' who were granted continuous, permanent or long-term residence permit. There are no statistics on irregularly staying stateless persons in Bulgaria, but some indirect data can be traced in the statistics on immigration detainees and return orders issued. The State Agency for Refugees gathers data on the number of stateless asylum seekers and stateless beneficiaries of international protection. The Ministry of Justice gathers data on the number | National Statistical Institute of Bulgaria, International Migration in 2017 by Age and Citizenship of the Migrants, http://www.nsi.bg/en/content/13040/internatio nal-migration-age-and-citizenship-migrants Decision No.812104-135 of 8 June 2018 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria Foundation for Access to Rights and ENS, "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention in Bulgaria", pp.15-17, http://www.farbg.eu/wp- content/uploads/2016/07/1221_ENS_Detention Reports Bulgaria 5.pdf The State Agency for Refugees, https://aref.government.bg/index.php/en/ |

| | | | | | of stateless persons who obtained Bulgarian | |
|------|---|---|------------------|----------|---|---|
| | | | | | citizenship. | |
| | | | Do Govt | As above | Yes. The Migration Directorate at the Bulgarian | Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to |
| | | | authorities | | Ministry of the Interior gathers statistical data | provide access to public information, Ministry of |
| | | | define | | on the number of 'persons with unknown | the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |
| | | | categories of | | citizenship' among foreign nationals with | |
| | | | persons who | | continuous, permanent and long-term | Decision No. 212164 - 54 of 21 June 2016 to |
| | | | may overlap | | residence. According to the data provided by | provide access to public information, Ministry of |
| | | | with stateless | | the Migration Directorate, as of 8 June 2018 | the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |
| | | | (e.g. unknown | | the number of 'persons with unknown | |
| POP | 1 | b | nationality, | | citizenship' is 103. | |
| 1 01 | 1 | | unspecified | | | |
| | | | nationality, | | | |
| | | | other)? Are | | | |
| | | | statistics on | | | |
| | | | these available? | | | |
| | | | If, yes, please | | | |
| | | | indicate | | | |
| | | | categories and | | | |
| | | | statistics. | | | |
| | | | What is the | As above | UNHCR does not have an estimate of the | Response by UNHCR Representation in Bulgaria. |
| | | | UNHCR | | population of stateless persons and/or those of | |
| | | | estimate for the | | risk at statelessness in Bulgaria. | |
| | | | population of | | | |
| | | | stateless | | | |
| | | | persons and/or | | | |
| POP | 1 | С | those at risk of | | | |
| | | | statelessness on | | | |
| | | | the territory? | | | |
| | | | What is | | | |
| | | | UNHCR's source | | | |
| | | | for this | | | |
| | | | information? | | | |
| | | | Are there | As above | The State Agency for Refugees (SAR) gathers | Decision No. RD 05 -127/ 16.02.2018 to provide |
| | | | indirect (proxy) | | statistics on the citizenship of asylum seekers | access to public information, Chairperson of the |
| POP | 1 | d | sources of | | and beneficiaries of international protection in | State Agency for Refugees |
| | | | statistics on | | Bulgaria. According to SAR, in 2017, there were | |
| | | | stateless | | 29 stateless persons and 1 person from the | |

| | | | 1 | | | ((Oid-Tit/)d | Di-i N- 042404 425 (0.1 2040) |
|-----|---|--------|---|---|------------------------------|--|---|
| | | | | persons? E.g. | | "Occupied Territory" who sought asylum in | Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to |
| | | | | categories of | | Bulgaria. In 2017 refugee status was granted to | provide access to public information, Ministry of |
| | | | | persons for | | 14 stateless persons and subsidiary protection | the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |
| | | | | which statistics | | to 11 stateless persons. In 2016, 69 stateless | |
| | | | | are available | | persons and 1 person from the "Occupied | |
| | | | | where stateless | | Territory" applied for international protection. | |
| | | | | persons may be | | In 2016 refugee status was granted to 13 | |
| | | | | more highly | | stateless persons and subsidiary protection to | |
| | | | | represented | | 8 stateless persons. When imposing | |
| | | | | (e.g. relevant | | "expulsion" and "return", the Ministry of | |
| | | | | country of | | Interior states the citizenship of the foreign | |
| | | | | origin or | | citizen in the respective order. The Migration | |
| | | | | profiles (e.g. | | Directorate has information about Palestinians | |
| | | | | Palestinians or | | who are issued such an order. In practice, | |
| | | | | Syrian Kurds)? | | stateless persons are often assigned to a | |
| | | | | Please provide | | country of origin that they are assumed to | |
| | | | | explanation and | | come from or have some cultural or historical | |
| | | | | figures. | | link with. | |
| | | | | Have there | UNHCR Global Action Plan to | No. | |
| | | | | been surveys or | End Statelessness 2014-2024: | | |
| | | | | mapping | Action 10 | | |
| | | | | studies done to | | | |
| POP | 1 | e | | estimate the | | | |
| | | | | population of | | | |
| | | | | stateless | | | |
| | | | | persons in the | | | |
| | | | | country? | | | |
| | | | | Are there other | As above | In 2016, the Foundation for Access to Rights | Foundation for Access to Rights and ENS, |
| | | | | sources of | | (FAR) under a partnership agreement with the | "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary |
| | | | | estimates for | | European Network on Statelessness, submitted | Detention in Bulgaria", pp. 15-17, |
| | | | | the population | | freedom of information requests and gathered | http://www.farbg.eu/wp- |
| 000 | | r | | of stateless | | | content/uploads/2016/07/1221 ENS Detention |
| POP | 1 | Ť | | persons (not | | the Ministry of the Interior, the State Agency | Reports Bulgaria 5.pdf |
| | | | | covered by the | | for Refugees and the Ministry of Justice. | |
| | | | | above)? If so, | | | |
| | | | | list sources and | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| POP | 1 | e f | | studies done to estimate the population of stateless persons in the country? Are there other sources of estimates for the population of stateless persons (not covered by the above)? If so, | | (FAR) under a partnership agreement with the European Network on Statelessness, submitted freedom of information requests and gathered data on the number of stateless persons from the Ministry of the Interior, the State Agency | "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention in Bulgaria", pp. 15-17, http://www.farbg.eu/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/1221_ENS_Detention |

| | | 1 | 1 | | | |
|-----|---|---|-------------------|----------|--|--|
| | | | | As above | Yes. According to the study, carried out by FAR | Foundation for Access to Rights and ENS, |
| | | | | | for ENS in 2016: "As pointed out above, upon | "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary |
| | | | Are there issue | | detention in Bulgaria stateless persons are | Detention in Bulgaria", p.15, |
| | | | with reliability | | usually assigned to a country of origin that they | http://www.farbg.eu/wp- |
| | | | of stateless | | are deemed to have come from or have some | content/uploads/2016/07/1221_ENS_Detention |
| POP | 1 | g | data? If yes, | | cultural or historical link with. In the removal | Reports Bulgaria 5.pdf |
| | | | please describe | | and detention orders stateless persons are | |
| | | | why. | | identified as citizens of those countries. | |
| | | | wily. | | Therefore, the validity of official statistical data | |
| | | | | | regarding stateless persons in detention should | |
| | | | | | be addressed with caution." | |
| | | | Are there | As above | In view of the findings in the 2016 study carried | Foundation for Access to Rights, "Protecting |
| | | h | indications tha | | out by FAR for ENS, there are indications that | Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention in |
| | | | the stateless | | stateless detainees are underreported. | Bulgaria", p.15, |
| POP | 1 | | population is | | | http://www.farbg.eu/wp- |
| PUP | 1 | n | either over or | | | content/uploads/2016/07/1221 ENS Detention |
| | | | under | | | Reports Bulgaria 5.pdf |
| | | | reported? | | | |
| | | | Please describe | | | |
| | | | Please provide | As above | According to the statistics of the State Agency | Decision No. RD 05 – 127/16.02.2018 to provide |
| | | | any available | | for Refugees (SAR), in 2017 there were 29 | access to public information, Chairperson of the |
| | | | figures on | | stateless persons and 1 person from the | State Agency for Refugees. |
| | | | stateless | | "Occupied Territory" who sought asylum in | |
| | | | refugees or | | Bulgaria. In 2017 refugee status was recognized | |
| | | | asylum seekers | | to 14 stateless persons and subsidiary | |
| | | | (if there is data | | protection to 11 stateless persons. | |
| | | | please clarify | | In 2016, 69 stateless persons and 1 person | |
| DOD | 1 | | whether Govt | | from the "Occupied Territory" applied for | |
| POP | 1 | 1 | also counts | | asylum. In 2016, 13 stateless persons received | |
| | | | stateless | | refugee status and 8 stateless persons received | |
| | | | refugees and | | subsidiary protection. | |
| | | | asylum seekers | | | |
| | | | in the stateless | | | |
| | | | population to | | | |
| | | | avoid | | | |
| | | | under/over | | | |
| | | | reporting). | | | |

| POP | 2 | а | Stateless in detention data | Number of stateless persons in immigration detention | As above and see also norms in Detention section. | According to Decision No. 212164-54 of 21 June 2016 to provide access to public information, issued by the Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria, the number of stateless persons in immigration detention in Bulgaria is as follows: In 2007: 1; In 2008: 9; In 2009: 6; In 2010: 10; In 2011: 5; In 2012: 26; In 2013: 38; In 2014: 11; In 2015: 31; As of 15 June 2016: 3. According to the answer in Decision No. 812104-135 of 8 June 2018 to provide access to public information, issued by the Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria: In 2016, only 1 "person who identified himself as stateless" was detained (this data contradicts the answer provided by the Ministry of the Interior in June 2016); In 2017, 3 "persons who identified themselves as stateless" were detained; As of 21 May 2018, 2 "persons who identified themselves as stateless" were detained. In the answer provided by the Ministry of the Interior in June 2018 the authorities refer to "persons who identified themselves as stateless" and it remains unclear whether the authorities considered them as stateless (for example, in the detention and return orders issued). | Decision No. 212164-54 of 21 June 2016 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. Decision No. 812104-135 of 8 June 2018 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |
|-----|---|---|-----------------------------|---|---|--|--|
| POP | 2 | b | | Are there statistics on individuals released from immigration detention who were unremovable, their country of origin and | As above | No. The Migration Directorate, Ministry of Interior, does not keep statistics on the number of individuals released from immigration detention whose return orders were not enforced due to lack of the necessary documentation. | Decision No. 212164 -54 of 21 June 2016 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |

| | | length of | | |
|--|--|---------------|--|--|
| | | detention? If | | |
| | | yes, please | | |
| | | provide. | | |

Statelessness Determination and Status

| Cat | Q | Sub | Subtheme | Question | International Norms / Good Practice | Answer | Source |
|-----|---|-----|---|---|---|--|--|
| IDP | 1 | a | Definition of a stateless person | Is there a definition of a stateless person in national law? Do the definition and exclusion provisions align with the 1954 Convention? Please provide details. | UN Convention Relating to the Status of Stateless Persons, 1954: Article 1(1) and 1(2). | Yes. There is a definition of a stateless person in Article 2(2) and Article 21b of the Law on Foreign Nationals in Republic of Bulgaria (LFRB): a stateless person is "a person who is not considered as a national by any state in accordance with its legislation" which is a narrower definition than the one in the 1954 Convention. According to Article 21e(1) of LFRB, a person is excluded from the status of a stateless person based on these separate grounds: 1. he falls within the scope of Article 1(2) of the 1954 Convention Relating to the Status of Stateless Persons; 2. he did not declare his citizenship in order to receive stateless status. However, furthermore, according to article 21e(2) of LFRB, a refusal may be issued to an applicant who: "1. has entered the country or attempted to pass through it not through the places established for that or by using untrue or forged documents; 2. resides illegally on the territory of the Republic of Bulgaria as of the date of submission of the application; 3. has resided lawfully and without interruption on the territory of the Republic of Bulgaria for less than 5 years." These de-facto exclusion clauses in Article 21e(2) LFRB contradict the 1954 Convention as no requirements for lawful residence or for lawful residence for a certain period of time are envisaged. | Law on the Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria – Article 2(2) and Article 21e (in Bulgarian: 21 д), para 1 and 2 of LFRB, https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (В) |

¹⁴

| | | | | Which of the following best describes the situation in your country? Choose only one and then proceed to question indicated. | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: it is implicit in the 1954 Convention that States must identify stateless persons within their jurisdictions so as to provide them appropriate treatment in order to comply with their | #1. There is a dedicated statelessness determination procedure (SDP) established in law. | Law on the Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) Implementing Rules of the Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135738597 (B) |
|-----|---|---|------------------------------------|--|--|---|---|
| IDP | 1 | b | Existence of a dedicated SDP | 1. There is a dedicated statelessness determination procedure (SDP) established in law, administrative guidance, or judicial procedure (proceed to Question 2a). | Convention commitments. • UNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6): Establishing a statelessness determination procedure is the most efficient means for States Parties to the 1954 Convention to identify the beneficiaries of that Convention. | | |
| IDP | 2 | а | | You have identified that your country has a dedicated SDP established in law, administrative guidance or judicial procedure. Which authority is responsible for determining statelessness? | • ENS (2013), Statelessness Determination and the Protection of Stateless Persons: a summary guide of good practices: There is no general rule for appointing the most appropriate authority for statelessness determination the structure must be evaluated in light of the specific national circumstances. | The Director of the Migration Directorate at the Ministry of Interior or an official authorised by him/her. | Law on the Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 21d (In Bulgarian: 21r), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |

| | | 1 | 1 | ı | | | |
|-----|---|-----|-----------|--------------------|---------------------------------------|---|--|
| | | | | | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | Yes, the application must be made on a specific | Implementing Rules of the Law on Foreign |
| | | | | | <u>Protection of Stateless</u> | form - in accordance with Annex 6a of the | Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article |
| | | | | | <u>Persons</u> : For procedures to be | Implementing Rules. There are no instructions | 63a(1), |
| | | | | | fair and efficient, access to | in the application form on how to fill it in. | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135738597 (B) |
| | | | | | them must be ensured. | | |
| | | | | | Dissemination of information, | | |
| | | | | | including through targeted | | |
| | | | | | information campaigns | | |
| | | | | | counselling on the procedures | | |
| | | | | | Given that individuals are | | |
| | | | | | sometimes unaware of SDPs | | |
| | | | | | or hesitant to | | |
| | | | | | applyprocedures can | | |
| | | | | Must an | usefully contain safeguards | | |
| | | | | application for | permitting State authorities to | | |
| | | | | statelessness | initiate a procedure. | | |
| | | | | status be made | UNHCR (Good Practices Paper | | |
| | | | | on a specific | <u>6):</u> | | |
| IDP | 2 | L . | Access to | form? Are there | ENS (2013), Statelessness | | |
| IDP | 2 | b | procedure | clear instructions | Determination and the | | |
| | | | (SDP) | on how to make a | Protection of Stateless | | |
| | | | | claim for | Persons: a summary guide of | | |
| | | | | statelessness or | good practices: Bureaucratic | | |
| | | | | how to fill in the | difficulties (such as | | |
| | | | | relevant forms? | complicated application | | |
| | | | | | forms, inflexible procedures, | | |
| | | | | | strict language requirements, | | |
| | | | | | limited places where claims | | |
| | | | | | can be submitted, high costs, | | |
| | | | | | etc.) can encumber, or even | | |
| | | | | | impede access to SDPs. | | |
| | | | | | ENS (2016), Protecting | | |
| | | | | | Stateless Persons from | | |
| | | | | | Arbitrary Detention in the | | |
| | | | | | United Kingdom: Any | | |
| | | | | | application form to apply for | | |
| | | | | | stateless status should be | | |
| | | | | | simplified and offered in a | | |

| IDP | 2 | С | | Do submissions and/or other written evidence have to be submitted in an official language? | variety of languages [and] made freely available, including in immigration detention centres. UNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6): As above. | Yes. The general rule for administrative procedures is that documents in a foreign language shall be accompanied by translation into Bulgarian. In its official response to our freedom of information request, the Migration Directorate at the Ministry of the Interior referred to article 63h (in Bulgarian: 633) of the Implementing Rules of the Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria. According to this article, the documents that are submitted by the applicants shall meet the requirements of the relevant provisions of the bilateral agreements or of the Convention of 5 October 1961 Abolishing the Requirement of Legalisation for Foreign Public Documents or of the Bulgarian Regulation on Legalization, Certification and Translation of Documents and Other Documents (SG, issue 73 of 1958). The | Administrative Procedure Code, Article 14(3), https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135521015 (B) Decision No. 812104-135 of 8 June 2018 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. Implementing Rules of the Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135738597 (B) |
|-----|---|---|---|--|--|---|---|
| IDP | 2 | d | : | Can an application for stateless status be made orally to a public official? | UNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6): As above. UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: Given that individuals are sometimes unaware of SDPs or hesitant to apply for statelessness | documents shall be translated into Bulgarian by a certified translator. No. The procedure starts with a written application. | Implementing Rules of the Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 63a(1), https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135738597 (B) |
| | | | | | status, procedures can usefully contain safeguards permitting State authorities to initiate a procedure. | | |

| IDP | 2 | е | Are there obligations in law on authorities to consider the application? | UNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6): access to the SDP must be guaranteed. | Yes. After all relevant facts and circumstances have been established, the director of the Migration Directorate or an official authorised by him/her shall issue a decision granting or refusing the status of a stateless person in the Republic of Bulgaria. | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 21d (1) (In Bulgarian: 21r), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
|-----|---|---|--|---|---|--|
| IDP | 2 | f | Are government authorities authorised to initiate SDPs ex officio? | UNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6):it is recommended that governmental authorities be authorised to initiate these procedures ex officio ENS (2013), Statelessness Determination and the Protection of Stateless Persons: a summary guide of good practices: as above. | No. The law requires submission of an application form by the person. | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 21c (In Bulgarian:21в), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| IDP | 2 | g | Is there an application fee? | UNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6): access to the SDP must be guaranteed. | An application fee is not explicitly envisaged in law. However, in practice, in the case of a stateless person followed by FAR, the migration authorities collected a fee for submitting the application on statelessness determination. The amount of the fee was 10 BGN (5 EUR as of Feb 2019). | Tariff No. 4 on the Fees Collected in the System of the Ministry of the Interior under the Law on State Taxation Observation by FAR lawyer Denitsa Georgieva made on 27 November 2017 at the Regional Directorate of the Ministry of the Interior in the city of Plovdiv. |
| IDP | 2 | h | Is there a requirement for lawful stay to access the SDP? | UNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6): Access to the procedure needs to be open to anyone who claims to be stateless, regardless oflawful stay or residence ENS (2013), Statelessness Determination and the Protection of Stateless Persons: a summary guide of good practices: Everyone in a state's territory must have access to SDPs. There is no basis in the 1954 Convention | There is no requirement for lawful stay to access the SDP. However, the competent authority may refuse to grant stateless status to a person who resides unlawfully on the territory of the Republic of Bulgaria. | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria – Article 21e(2)(2) LFRB (In Bulgarian: член 21 д, ал. 2, т. 2) https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |

| | | | | for requiring that applicant be lawfully within a state. | | |
|-----|---|---|---|--|--|---|
| IDP | 2 | i | Is there a time limit beyond which a person cannot access the SDP? If so, what i this and can the requirement be waived? | - | No, there is no time limit. | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| IDP | 2 | j | Is the examination of statelessness claims conducted by a dedicated centralised body with relevant expertise? If yes, please specify. | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: States may choose between a centralised procedure or one that is conducted by local authorities. Centralised procedures are preferable as they are more likely to develop the necessary expertise UNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6): Where to situate SDPs institutionally is a matter of State discretion and can vary from one country to the next. Regardlessit is important that examiners develop expertise while ensuring that the procedures are accessible | Yes. The examination of statelessness claims is conducted by a centralised body, the Migration Directorate at the Ministry of the Interior, which communicates with other authorities in the procedure: the State Agency for National Security, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Ministry of Justice. | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) Implementing Rules of the Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 63a(3), Article 63b(1), Article 63c, Article 63 e. In Bulgarian: чл. 63a, ал. 3, чл. 63б, ал. 1, чл. 63в, чл. 63д), https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135738597 (B) |

| IDP | 2 | k | Is there training to inform different government bodies about statelessness and SDPs? If yes, please provide details (e.g. who provides training to whom and how often?) | UNHCR Executive Committee, Conclusion on Identification, Prevention and Reduction of Statelessness and Protection of Stateless Persons No. 106 (LVII) – 2006: Requests UNHCR to actively disseminate information and, where appropriate, train government counterparts on appropriate mechanisms for identifying, recording, and granting a status to stateless persons. UNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6): Training sessions for officials and meetings between the various decentralised bodies, UNHCR and civil society take place on a regular basis, allowing for an exchange of information and discussion | The question was asked in a freedom of information request addressed to the Migration Directorate at the Ministry of the Interior. The brief answer obtained is that "trainings are conducted by UNHCR". According to the response received by UNHCR: "UNHCR regularly conducts national trainings for staff responsible for the examination of SDP applications. The first such training took place in October 2017. In addition, UNHCR includes the issue of statelessness in its regular training provided to the Border Police (3 times per year) and Directorate Migration (employees in charge of detention centers and imposition of return measures) (2-3 times per year)." | Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. Response by UNHCR Representation in Bulgaria. |
|-----|---|---|--|---|--|---|
| IDP | 2 | I | Is there cooperation between agencies that may have contact with stateless people? If so, how are cases referred to the appropriate authority for determination? | UNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6): cooperation between actors working on statelessness and the various government agencies involved in determining statelessness is good practice. | According to the law, the SDP shall be suspended when it is established that the applicant has also applied for international protection. The SDP shall be suspended until the final decision on the application for international protection is made, unless it is possible to determine statelessness without having to consult the authorities of the country of origin. In case international protection is refused, withdrawn or terminated, or when the asylum procedure is terminated, the SDP may be resumed upon submission of a written application by the applicant. The question was asked in a freedom of information request addressed to the Migration Directorate at the | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 21h, (In Bulgarian: чл. 21з), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |

| | 1 | | | | | Ministry of the Interior The survey state! | |
|-----|---|---|------------|--------------------|---------------------------------|---|--|
| | | | | | | Ministry of the Interior. The answer obtained is | |
| | | | | | | that cooperation between institutions is | |
| | | | | | | established in Article 63e (in Bulgarian: 63д) of | |
| | | | | | | the Law on Foreign Nationals. The file of the | |
| | | | | | | applicant shall be sent to the State Agency for | |
| | | | | | | National Security and its respective territorial | |
| | | | | | | directorates for opinion. Their opinion shall be | |
| | | | | | | submitted in writing within 30 working days. | |
| | | | | | | The Migration Directorate may provide a copy | |
| | | | | | | of the applicant's file to the Ministry of Foreign | |
| | | | | | | Affairs for administrative assistance. The | |
| | | | | | | Ministry of Foreign Affairs shall provide the | |
| | | | | | | requested information within 45 days. The | |
| | | | | | | Migration Directorate may also request | |
| | | | | | | information on the nationality of the person | |
| | | | | | | from the Ministry of Justice. | |
| | | | | | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | It is rather the applicant who has the burden of | Implementing Rules of the Law on Foreign |
| | | | | | Protection of Stateless | proof. Article 63d of the Implementing Rules of | Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 63d |
| | | | | | Persons:the burden of proof | the Law on Foreign Nationals reads the | (in Bulgarian: чл. 63г), |
| | | | | | is in principle shared, in that | following: | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135738597 (B) |
| | | | | | both the applicant and | "(1) In the course of the statelessness | |
| | | | | | examiner must cooperate to | determination procedure, the applicant should | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of |
| | | | | | obtain evidence and to | prove or justify his position as a stateless | Bulgaria, Article 21c(7) (in Bulgarian: чл. 21в, ал. |
| | | | | | establish the facts. | person, in particular as regards: | 7); Article 21d (1) (in Bulgarian: 21r), |
| | | | | Who has the | UNHCR (Good Practices Paper | 1. his place of birth; | https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| | | | | burden of proof in | 6): SDPs must take into | 2. previous residence; | |
| IDP | 3 | а | Assessment | the SDP? Is this | consideration the difficulties | 3. citizenship of family members and their | |
| | | | (SDP) | shared in | inherent in proving | parents. | |
| | | | | practice, even if | statelessness. UNHCR | (2) The application shall be accompanied by a | |
| | | | | not in law? | recommends that SDPs | certificate of birth, official documents certifying | |
| | | | | | provide for a shared burden of | the circumstances under para. 1, and a | |
| | | | | | proof | document on his / her legal residence on the | |
| | | | | | ENS (2013), Statelessness | territory of the Republic of Bulgaria. | |
| 1 | | | | | <u>Determination and the</u> | (3) The Migration Directorate may require | |
| | | | | | Protection of Stateless | additional information from other state bodies | |
| | | | | | Persons: a summary guide of | in order to clarify the circumstances of the | |
| | | | | | good practices: The applicant | possibility of granting the status of a stateless | |
| | | | | | has a duty to provide as full | person." | |

| | | | | and truthful accountas possible and to submit all evidence reasonably available. Similarly, the determination authority is required to obtain and present all relevant evidence reasonably available to it authorities need to [give] sympathetic consideration to testimonial explanations regarding the absence of certain kinds of evidence. UNHCR Expert Meeting, Statelessness Determination Procedures and the Status of Stateless Persons 2010: It is incumbent on individuals to cooperate to establish relevant facts. If an individual can demonstrate, on the basis of all reasonably available evidence, that he or she is evidently not a national, then the burden should shift to the State to prove that the individual is a national of a State. | According to Article 21c(7) LFRB, in the course of the SDP, the applicant is obliged to assist the authorities by presenting his situation in good faith and submitting all the evidence relevant for the examination of his application which he has or may reasonably be presumed to be available to him. Still, it could be argued that the administrative authority is obliged to clarify all relevant facts, as Article 21d(1) LFRB stipulates that the Directors of Directorate Migration or a person authorised by him is to issue a decision after establishing all relevant facts and circumstances. | |
|-----|---|---|--|--|---|--|
| IDP | 3 | b | What is the standard of proof? Is it the same as in asylum applications? | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: States areadvised to adopt the same standard of proof as in refugee status determination, namely to a "reasonable degree" UNHCR, Nationality and Statelessness, Handbook for Parliamentarians No. 22, | In Bulgaria the standard of proof in the SDP is higher than the one applied to asylum applications. In the national asylum legislation, there is an explicit provision, which states the following: "Where the applicant's allegations are not supported by evidence, they shall be considered credible if he has made an effort to substantiate his/her application, has provided a satisfactory explanation for the lack of evidence and his statements have been assessed to be | Article 75(3) of the Law on Asylum and Refugees, https://lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135453184 (B) |

| | 1 | | | 2014: December - f.H | consensus consists and one district. The dealers | |
|----------|---|---|-------------------------------|----------------------------------|--|---|
| | | | | 2014: Because of the | uncontroversial and credible. The lack of | |
| | | | | difficulties inherent in proving | sufficient evidence of persecution, including | |
| | | | | statelessness, the threshold of | the failure to conduct an interview under Art. | |
| | | | | evidence required should | 63a(6), cannot be a ground for refusal to grant | |
| | | | | not be too high. States are | international protection." There is no such | |
| | | | | therefore advised to adopt | provision regarding the SDP. | |
| | | | | the same standard of proof as | | |
| | | | | in refugee status | | |
| | | | | determination. | | |
| | | | | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | There are special rules envisaged for | Law on the Foreign Nationals in the Republic of |
| | | | | <u>Protection of Stateless</u> | (unaccompanied) minors. The application of an | Bulgaria, Article 21c (In Bulgarian: 21в) |
| | | | | Persons: As a result of | unaccompanied minor can be submitted | https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| | | | | discrimination, women might | through a representative of an NGO working to | |
| | | | | face additional barriers in | protect the rights of vulnerable groups or by | Implementing Rules of the Law on Foreign |
| | | | | acquiring relevant | another person designated as his/her | Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article |
| | | | | documentation, such as birth | representative by law. The application of a | 63b(1) & (3), |
| | | | | certificates or other | minor who is less than 14 years old is filed by | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135738597_(B) |
| | | | | identification documents that | his/her parents or guardians. The application of | |
| | | | la thara rasport | would be pertinent to | a minor who is between 14 and 18 years old is | |
| | | | Is there respect for specific | establishing their nationality | filed in the presence of his/her parents or | |
| | | | protection needs | status Children, especially | guardians who shall express their consent by | |
| | | | and evidentiary | unaccompanied children, may | putting a signature on the application. | |
| | | | • | face acute challenges in | In the case of minors who are less than 14 years | |
| IDP | 3 | С | challenges | communicating basic facts | old, the interview is conducted with their | |
| | | | presented by | with respect to their | parents or guardians. When interviewing | |
| | | | women, children | nationality. Statesmust | minors aged between 14 and 18 years, they are | |
| | | | and people with | follow the principle of | accompanied by their parents or guardians. | |
| | | | disabilities in the | pursuing the best interests of | In the case of minors, the minutes from the | |
| | | | SDP? | the child | interview shall be signed/countersigned in | |
| | | | | • Gen. Rec. 32 of CEDAW: | accordance with Art. 15(7) of the Child | |
| | | | | Nationality laws may | Protection Act – that is, by a representative of | |
| | | | | discriminate directly or | the Social Assistance Directorate (social | |
| | | | | indirectly against women. | worker). The provisions of the Law on Child | |
| | | | | Legislative provisions that | Protection in relation to conducting | |
| | | | | appear gender neutral may in | administrative proceedings with children are | |
| 1 | | | | practice have a | also applicable. | |
| | | | | disproportionate and negative | | |
| | | | | impact on the enjoyment of | | |
| <u> </u> | | | | impact on the enjoyment of | | |

| | | | | | the right to nationality by women | | |
|-----|---|---|------------------------------------|--|---|---|---|
| IDP | 3 | d | | Are decision makers presented with clear guidance on how to determine statelessness, including sources of evidence and procedures for evidence gathering to establish statelessness? Please provide details. | ENS (2013), Statelessness Determination and the Protection of Stateless Persons: a summary guide of good practices: determining authorities can benefit significantly from any concrete guidance that sets clear benchmarks and pathways for the establishment of material facts and circumstances | The question was asked in a freedom of information request addressed to the Migration Directorate at the Ministry of the Interior. The answer obtained is that "Yes, this guidance is the Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria and the Implementing Rules of the Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria". Therefore, decision makers are presented with no further guidance than the legal framework. | Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |
| IDP | 4 | a | Procedural Protections (SDP) | Is there free legal aid available during the application? | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: applicants are to have access to legal counsel; where free legal assistance is available, it is to be offered to applicants without financial means. ENS (2013), Statelessness Determination and the Protection of Stateless Persons: a summary guide of good practices: If state funded legal aid is available in the country it should be provided to stateless claimants. If there is no state funded legal aid but asylum claimants can | Currently in practice free legal aid is provided by NGOs. For example, FAR has a partnership agreement with ENS for provision of free legal aid in cases of strategic importance for social justice. In its answer to our freedom of information request, the Migration Directorate referred to the general regime under the Law on Legal Aid. According to this, the following types of legal aid are provided by the State, if the conditions and procedure are met: consultation aiming to achieve a friendly settlement before the initiation of court proceedings; preparation of documents for filing a court appeal; litigation when the case is already filed in court; litigation in case of detention. In practice, access to the possibilities under the Law on Legal Aid is still hampered by bureaucratic obstacles such as cumbersome | National Legal Aid Bureau, "Information – Subcategories – Legal Aid", https://www.nbpp.government.bg/en/information On (B) Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. Law on Legal Aid, Article 22(1)(10), https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135511185 (B) |

| | | | | access legal aid free of charge, then the same level of access | procedures for granting legal aid, language barriers, low awareness of the rights of | |
|-----|---|---|-----------------|---|---|--|
| | | | | should be provided to | stateless persons, lack of expertise, etc. These | |
| | | | | stateless claimants. | obstacles could be overcome by raising | |
| | | | | | awareness among stateless persons, the | |
| | | | | | authorities and lawyers at the National Legal Aid Bureau on the rights and obligations of | |
| | | | | | stateless persons.The Bulgarian Helsinki | |
| | | | | | Committee, through funding from UNHCR, also | |
| | | | | | provides legal assistance and counselling, | |
| | | | | | including for stateless persons and those at risk | |
| | | | | | of statelessness. | |
| | | | | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | Yes, an interview is always offered. The | Law on the Foreign Nationals in the Republic of |
| | | | Is an interviev | <u>Protection of Stateless</u> | claimant will be informed about the date, time | Bulgaria, Article 21 d(2) (In Bulgarian: член 21г, |
| | | | always offered | Persons: The right to an | and place of the interview in writing. If | ал. 2); Article 63B (1) and Article 63c; |
| IDP | 4 | b | (unless grantii | individual interview, and | necessary, additional interviews may be | https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| | | | without | necessary assistance with | conducted. The decision is made after an | |
| | | | interview)? | translation/interpretation throughout the process, are | interview with the applicant. | |
| | | | | essential | | |
| | | | | ENS (2013), Statelessness | The general rule regarding administrative | Administrative Procedure Code, Article 14(4), |
| | | | | Determination and the | proceedings in Bulgaria is that the expenses for | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135521015 (B) |
| | | | | Protection of Stateless | the interpreter are borne by the person who | () |
| | | | | Persons: a summary guide of | does not speak Bulgarian, if the administrative | Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to |
| | | | | good practices: assistance | procedure has begun at his/her request, unless | provide access to public information, Ministry of |
| | | | Are interprete | should be available for | a law or an international treaty provide | the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |
| | | | provided for | translation and interpretation | otherwise. The official answer to our freedom | |
| | | | statelessness | in respect of written | of information request by the Migration | Article 106a of the Law on the Ministry of |
| IDP | 4 | С | determination | applications and interviews (good practice is free of | Directorate was that in the SDP free | Interior (promulgated in State Gazette No 97 of 2017, in force as of 01.01.2018) |
| | | | interviews? A | e charge). | interpreters are provided under the Law on the Ministry of the Interior. However, in its official | 2017, III Torce as or 01.01.2018) |
| | | | they free of | charge). | reply the Migration Directorate does not refer | |
| | | | charge? | | to a specific article from the Law on the | |
| | | | | | Ministry of the Interior. According to the Law | |
| | | | | | on the Ministry of Interior, the police | |
| | | | | | authorities (such as the Migration Directorate | |
| | | | | | officials) may use an interpreter when | |
| | | | | | exercising their powers to explain the reasons | |

| | | ı | 1 | 1 | | |
|-----|---|---|---------------------|--|--|---|
| | | | | | for the actions taken and to clarify the rights of | |
| | | | | | a person who does not speak Bulgarian. | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | Are there quality | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | UNHCR, through its representative in Bulgaria, | Implementing Rules of the Law on Foreign |
| | | | assurance audits | Protection of Stateless | has the right to information, to access the | Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 63g, |
| | | | of the SDP? Does | Persons: States are | applicant's file at any stage of the SDP, and to | (In Bulgarian: член 63ж), |
| | | | UNHCR | encouraged to incorporate | attend the interviews conducted with the | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135738597 (B) |
| | | | participate in the | the following safeguards: [] | applicant. Asked about further quality | 1111531// WWW.CXI.DS/ 14W3/14U3/14U3/14U3/ |
| IDP | 4 | d | proceedings? Can | access to UNHCR is | assurance audits, the Migration Directorate | Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to |
| IDF | 4 | u | | | | |
| | | | they access files? | guaranteed. | referred to the right of the applicant to judicial | provide access to public information, Ministry of |
| | | | Do they play a | UNHCR (Good Practices Paper | review of the decision to refuse statelessness | the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |
| | | | quality | <u>6):</u> Quality assurance audits of | status/to terminate the proceedings. | |
| | | | monitoring or | SDPs are considered good | | |
| | | | training role? | practice. | | |
| | | | | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | Yes, the law refers to the general requirements | Law on the Foreign Nationals in the Republic of |
| | | | Are decisions | Protection of Stateless | for administrative decisions, stipulated in the | Bulgaria, Article 21g (In Bulgarian: член 21ж) |
| | | | (refusals and | Persons: States are | Code on Administrative Procedure. The latter | https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| IDP | 4 | е | grants) given with | encouraged, therefore, to | requires that decisions are made in writing with | . , |
| | | | reasons? And in | incorporate the following | reasons. | |
| | | | writing? | safeguards: [] decisions are | | |
| | | | | made in writing with reasons. | | |
| | | | | UNHCR (Good Practices Paper | No, there is no such referral mechanism. In | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of |
| | | | | 6): Efficient referral | | Bulgaria, Article 21h, (In Bulgarian: чл. 21з), |
| | | | | | case of a suspended SDP due to a pending | |
| | | | | mechanisms should be | asylum procedure, the SDP can be resumed | https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| | | | | established officials who | once the asylum procedure has ended with a | |
| | | | Is there a referral | may be in contact with | final decision having entered into force, upon | |
| | | | mechanism if an | stateless persons need to be | the submission of a written application by the | |
| IDP | 4 | f | individual has | trained to identify potential | applicant. | |
| IUF | 4 | ' | been refused | applicantsand refer them to | | |
| | | | asylum but may | appropriate channels. | | |
| | | | be stateless? | ENS (2013), Statelessness | | |
| | | | | Determination and the | | |
| | | | | Protection of Stateless | | |
| 1 | | | | Persons: a summary guide of | | |
| 1 | | | | good practices: The regulation | | |
| | | 1 | | Bood practices. | | |

| IDP | 5 | a | Protection during SDP | Does the applicant have automatic legal admission while their claim for stateless status is assessed? Is expulsion possible during the process? If yes, are there verified reports of expulsions? | should guarantee that proper cross-referral systems exist for cases where the two determination procedures are not conducted in a joint framework • UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: An individual awaiting a decision is entitled, at a minimum, to all rights based on jurisdiction or presence in the territory as well as "lawfully in" rights inter alia, identity papers, the right to self-employment, freedom of movement and protection against expulsion it is recommended that individuals receive the same standards of treatment as asylum-seekers ENS (2013), Statelessness Determination and the Protection of Stateless Persons: a summary guide of good practices: States should refrain from expelling or removing an individual from their territory pending the outcome of the determination | No, the applicant does not have automatic legal admission while their claim for stateless status is assessed. The law does not provide for such a right. Expulsion is possible during the process. In its answer to a freedom of information request submitted by FAR, the Migration Directorate replied that there are no cases of persons in a SDP who have been expelled. | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |
|-----|---|---|--------------------------|---|--|---|---|
| IDP | 5 | b | | Do applicants for stateless status who are awaiting a decision have permission to work, if they have | process. UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: Allowing individualsto engage in wage-earning employmentmay reduce the | If they have no other permission to stay in the country, applicants for stateless status who are awaiting a decision do not have a permission to work. | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |

| | | | no other permission in the cour Do applical stateless st with limite means hav access to | and self-sufficiency of the individuals concerned. atts for UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: The status of those | If the applicant already has lawful residence, he/she can apply for social assistance, unless the type of residence permit is 'continuous'. If the applicant has no other permission to stay in the country, he/she cannot apply for social | Law on Social Assistance, Article 2(6), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134405633 |
|-----|---|---|--|---|--|---|
| IDP | 5 | С | assistance meet their needs (she and welfar support)? I describe. | reflect applicable human basic rights such as assistance to meet basic needs. e Please | assistance. | |
| IDP | 5 | d | Is it possibl detain an applicant v they are in SDP? | Detention is therefore a measure of last resort and can | Yes, if the applicant has no other permission to stay in the country, the general rules on detention for the purpose of return might be applied to him/her. Furthermore, in December 2016 a new type of 'short-term' immigration detention (for up to 30 days) was introduced—its stated purpose according to the law is to conduct initial personal identification and to decide on the subsequent administrative measures to be taken. | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) Decision No. 812104-135 of 8 June 2018 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |
| IDP | 5 | е | Does law o set out a timeframe SDP? If so, complied v Can the de maker exte timeframe | r policy WNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6): Some of the most fundamental guarantees is it reflected in current State practice include: a time limit for a decision following nd the submission of a statelessness | The decision under the SDP shall be issued within 6 months from making the application. In case of legal or factual complexity the term may be extended for a further period of 2 months. The implementing rules on the application of the SDP in Bulgaria are in force since 27 June 2017. It is too early to assess whether the timeframe is generally complied | Law on the Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 21d(3) (In Bulgarian: член 21г, ал. 3), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |

| | | | | | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: In general, it is undesirable for a first instance decision to be issued more than six months from the submission of an application in exceptional circumstances it may be appropriate to allow the proceedings to last up to | with. In the individual cases followed by FAR, the timeframe has not been complied with and we have interpreted this as 'silent rejection' of the application. According to the Code on Administrative Procedure, there is a silent rejection when the administrative authority does not issue a decision within the timeframe set in law and has not informed the applicant of an extension of that timeframe. In such cases the silent rejection might be appealed within | |
|-----|---|---|------------------|---|---|--|---|
| | | | | | 12 months | one month from the date by which the decision should have been taken. In case of failure to appeal within that one-month period, the right to appeal is quashed (precluded). At the same time, "UNHCR wishes to note that since the beginning of the SDP in practice in July 2017, 43 positive decisions were issued until December 2017, thereby complying with the legal time-frame." | Response by the UNHCR Representation in Bulgaria. |
| IDP | 6 | a | Appeals (SDP) | Is there an automatic right of appeal in the case of refusal (on grounds of both law and fact)? | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: An effective right to appeal against a negative first instance decision is an essential safeguard in an SDP. | The applicant has a right to lodge an appeal before the court within 14 days of the notification of the decision. If the applicant fails to make the appeal within this timeframe, the right to appeal is quashed (precluded). | Law on the Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 21g (In Bulgarian: член 21ж) https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) Administrative Procedure Code, Article 149(1), https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135521015 (B) |
| IDP | 6 | đ | | Is legal aid available for appealing/applyin g to review a negative determination? | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: The applicant is to have access to legal counsel and, where free legal assistance is available, it is to be offered to applicants without financial means. ENS (2013), Statelessness Determination and the Protection of Stateless Persons: a summary guide of | Legal aid for appealing a negative statelessness determination is explicitly envisaged in the newly introduced provision of Article 22(1)(10), of the Law on Legal Aid (State Gazette No.97 of 6 December 2016). Currently FAR has a partnership agreement with ENS for provision of free legal aid in cases of strategic importance for social justice. The Bulgarian Helsinki Committee, through funding from UNHCR, also provides legal assistance and counselling, including to stateless persons and those at risk of statelessness | Law on Legal Aid, Article 22(1)(10), https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135511185 (B) Response by UNHCR Representation in Bulgaria. |

| | 1 | ı | | | | | |
|-----|---|---|-----------|-----------------------------------|---------------------------------|--|---|
| | | | | | good practices: Applicants are | | |
| | | | | | to have access to legal counsel | | |
| | | | | | both at first instance and | | |
| | | | | | upon appeal. | | |
| | | | | | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | Yes. The fee is 10 BGN (5 EUR at Feb 2019) for | Tariff No 1 to the Law on State Fees, Fees |
| | | | | | <u>Protection of Stateless</u> | submission of an appeal to the respective | Collected by the Courts, the Prosecutor's Office, |
| | | | | | Persons: An effective right to | administrative court. If the person doesn't have | the Investigation Service and the Ministry of |
| | | | | | appeal against a negative first | financial means to pay the fee, he or she could | Justice, section A – 2b, |
| | | | | Is there a fee for | instance decision is an | apply for a fee waiver before the court. It is | https://lex.bg/laws/ldoc/-14643200 (B) |
| IDP | 6 | С | | the appeal | essential safeguard. | noteworthy, that a significant increase in the | |
| | | | | application? | | fees to appeal before the court is currently | Civil Procedure Code, Article 83(2), |
| | | | | | | under an adoption procedure by the Bulgarian | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135558368 (B) |
| | | | | | | parliament. | " ' |
| | | | | | | | Administrative Procedure Code, Article 144, |
| | | | | | | | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135521015 (B) |
| | | | | Is there evidence | | So far there are no publications on the topic. | |
| | | | | of significant | | , | |
| | | | | errors in decision | | | |
| | | | | making? If so, is | | | |
| | | | | there a publicly | | | |
| | | | | available source | | | |
| | | | | (e.g. audits, | | | |
| IDP | 6 | d | | independent | | | |
| | | | | reports, academic | | | |
| | | | | research etc.)? If | | | |
| | | | | yes, please | | | |
| | | | | provide this. If | | | |
| | | | | anecdotal, please | | | |
| | | | | describe. | | | |
| | | | | | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | No. The law in Bulgaria is written in a way that | Law on the Foreign Nationals in the Republic of |
| | | | | Does recognition of statelessness | Protection of Stateless | only already lawfully residing persons can | Bulgaria, Article 21e(2) and Article 21i, |
| | | | | | | , | . , , , |
| | | | 6 | result in | Persons: The 1954 Convention | obtain stateless status. Thus, according to | https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| 100 | _ | | Stateless | permission to | [grants] stateless persons a | Article 21e(2) LFRB, a refusal may be issued to | |
| IDP | 7 | а | Status | stay/legal status? | core set of rights. Its | an applicant who: | |
| | | | (SDP) | Is status granted | provisions, along with | "1. has entered the country or attempted to | |
| | | | | immediately or | applicable standards of | pass through it not through the places | |
| | | | | automatically | international human rights | established for that or by using untrue or | |
| | | | | upon recognition | law, establish the minimum | forged documents; | |

| | | : | sinks and the ablication (| 2 | |
|---|---|---------------------|---------------------------------|---|---|
| | | or identification | rights and the obligations of | 2. resides illegally on the territory of the | |
| | | as stateless? | stateless persons in States | Republic of Bulgaria as of the date of | |
| | | | party to the 1954 Convention. | submission of the application; | |
| | | | The status granted to a | 3. has resided lawfully and without interruption | |
| | | | stateless person in a State | on the territory of the Republic of Bulgaria for | |
| | | | Party must reflect these | less than 5 years." | |
| | | | international standards | Furthermore, applicants are required to | |
| | | | Although the 1954 | present evidence of lawful stay for at least 5 | |
| | | | Convention does not explicitly | years upon submitting the application. The law | |
| | | | require States to grant a | says 'may' regarding the exclusion and it seems | |
| | | | person determined to be | that the authorities have the discretion to grant | |
| | | | stateless a right of residence, | stateless status, even if the person has not | |
| | | | granting such permission | resided lawfully. However, if this person gets | |
| | | | would fulfil the object and | status, he/she would not be able to obtain a | |
| | | | purpose of the treaty | travel document, which is the only ID document | |
| | | | | proving lawful stay envisaged for stateless | |
| | | | | persons. Article 21i LFRB states that a stateless | |
| | | | | person's travel document can be issued only to | |
| | | | | stateless persons who have long-term or | |
| | | | | permanent residence. | |
| | | | As above. | Besides the SDP introduced in Bulgarian law in | Law on the Foreign Nationals in the Republic of |
| | | Are there | | December 2016, there is one possibility for a | Bulgaria, Article 25(1)(12), |
| | | additional | | limited category of stateless persons to obtain | https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| | | requirements | | a residence permit under the LFRB. As well as | |
| | | beyond meeting | | being stateless, the persons have to meet the | FAR and ENS, "Protecting Stateless Persons from |
| | | the definition of a | | following cumulative conditions: | Arbitrary Detention in Bulgaria", p. 13, |
| | | stateless person | | 1. born in Bulgaria or entered the country prior | http://www.farbg.eu/wp- |
| 7 | h | and satisfying the | | to 27 December 1998; | content/uploads/2016/07/1221 ENS Detention |
| ′ | b | exclusion | | 2. stayed in Bulgaria ever since and not left the | Reports Bulgaria 5.pdf |
| | | provisions that a | | country; | |
| | | stateless person | | 3. from a former Soviet republic and not | |
| | | must meet to be | | recognised as a citizen by any of those | |
| | | granted | | republics. | |
| | | permission to | | This is a regularisation mechanism for a narrow | |
| | | stay/legal status? | | category of undocumented stateless persons in | |
| | | | | Bulgaria that was introduced in 2011. | |

| | 1 | 1 | | | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | The validity of the travel document of a | Law on Bulgarian Identity Deguments Article |
|----------|----------|---|--------|--------------------------|--|--|--|
| | | | | | | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | Law on Bulgarian Identity Documents, Article |
| | | | | | Protection of Stateless Persons: It is recommended | stateless person is from 3 months to up to 2 years. It is renewable. The law does not refer to | 59(1)(8), |
| | | | | | | , | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134424576 (B) |
| | | | | | that States grant persons | a period of validity of the status itself. | |
| | | | | | recognised as stateless a | | |
| | 100 7 | | | w long is initial | residence permit valid for at | | |
| IDP | 7 | С | | tus? Is | least two years, although | | |
| | | | | idence status | permits for a longer duration, | | |
| | | | rene | iewable? | such as five years, are | | |
| | | | | | preferable in the interests of | | |
| | | | | | stability. Such permits are to | | |
| | | | | | be renewable, providing the | | |
| | | | | | possibility of facilitated | | |
| | | | | | naturalisation | | |
| | | | | | UN Convention Relating to the | The law states that a travel document of a | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of |
| | | | ls a t | travel | Status of Stateless Persons, | stateless person can be issued only to stateless | Bulgaria, Article 21i, |
| | | | | cument issued | 1954, Art. 28: The Contracting | persons who have long-term or permanent | https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| IDP | 7 | d | 5.50 | to those | States shall issue to stateless | residence. | |
| IDP | ' | u | | | persons lawfully staying in | | Implementing Rules of the Law on Bulgarian |
| | | | | recognised as stateless? | their territory travel | | Identity Documents, Article 40(3), |
| | | | State | teless? | documents for the purpose of | | https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2135663268 (B) |
| | | | | | travel outside their territory | | |
| | | | | | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | In Bulgarian law there are no family reunion | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of |
| | | | | | Protection of Stateless | provisions that specifically concern individuals | Bulgaria, |
| | | | | | Persons: Although the 1954 | recognised as stateless. In case the stateless | https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| | | | | | Convention does not address | person is granted permanent residence or | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · |
| | | | | _ | family unity, States parties are | international protection, the family reunion | |
| | | | | nat are the | nevertheless encouraged to | provisions relevant for these categories of | |
| | | | | nily reunion | facilitate the reunion of those | persons would apply. | |
| IDP | 7 | e | | visions for | with recognised stateless | persons means apply | |
| | | | | ividuals | status in their territory with | | |
| | | | | ognised as | their spouses and | | |
| | | | state | teless? | dependents. Indeed, some | | |
| | | | | | States have obligations arising | | |
| | | | | | under relevant international | | |
| | | | | | or regional human rights | | |
| | | | | | treaties to do so. | | |
| <u> </u> | <u> </u> | | | | treaties to do so. | | |

| | | | | | LINUICD (2014) Heindhards | Van The status of a stateless names in Bullionia | Lawren Fareign Nationals in the Denuk!!f |
|-----|---|---|--|--------------------|---------------------------------|---|--|
| | | | | | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | Yes. The status of a stateless person in Bulgaria | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of |
| | | | | | Protection of Stateless | can be withdrawn if it is established by written | Bulgaria, Article 21k, |
| | | | | | Persons: If an individual | evidence that the data on the basis of which | https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| | | | | | recognised as stateless | the status was granted was untrue. This | |
| | | | | | subsequently acquires or | decision can be appealed. | |
| | | | | | reacquires the nationality of | | |
| | | | | | another State he or she will | | |
| | | | | | cease to be stateless in terms | | |
| | | | | Is residence | of the 1954 Convention. This | | |
| | | | | status granted to | may justify the cancellation of | | |
| IDP | 7 | f | | stateless people | a residence permit obtained | | |
| IDP | ' | · | | | on the basis of statelessness | | |
| | | | | revocable? If yes, | status, although | | |
| | | | | on what grounds? | proportionality considerations | | |
| | | | | | in relation to acquired rights | | |
| | | | | | and factors arising under | | |
| | | | | | international human rights | | |
| | | | | | law, such as the degree to | | |
| | | | | | which the individual | | |
| | | | | | has established a private and | | |
| | | | | | family life in the State, need | | |
| | | | | | to be taken into account. | | |
| | | | | | UN Convention Relating to the | No, stateless status in itself does not entail a | Law on Labour Migration and Labour Mobility, |
| | | | | | Status of Stateless Persons, | permission to work in Bulgaria. No permission | Article 9(1)(2) & (3), |
| | | | | | 1954: The Contracting States | is required from third country nationals who | https://www.lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2136803084 |
| | | | | | shall accord to stateless | have long-term or permanent residence. | (B) |
| | | | | | persons lawfully staying in | Stateless beneficiaries of international | |
| | | | | | their territory treatment as | protection are also entitled to work in Bulgaria | Law on Asylum and Refugees, Article 29(3), |
| | | | | Do people | favourable as possible and, in | without a need for a work permit. Asylum | https://lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135453184 (B) |
| | | | | granted stateless | any event, not less favourable | seekers acquire the right to work 3 months | Tittps://iex.bg/iaws/idoc/2135455164 (b) |
| IDP | 7 | g | | status have | than that accorded to | after the date on which they submitted their | |
| | | | | permission to | foreigners generally in the | application for international protection. The | |
| | | | | work? | | | |
| | | | | | same circumstances, as | rule is applicable to all asylum seekers, | |
| | | | | | regards the right to engage in | regardless of whether they are stateless or not. | |
| | | | | | wage-earning employment. | | |
| | | | | | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | | |
| | | | | | Protection of Stateless | | |
| | | | | | Persons: Recognition of an | | |

| | | | | individual as a stateless person under the 1954 Convention also triggers the "lawfully staying" rights, in addition to a right to residence. Thus, the right to work [] must accompany a residence permit. | | |
|-----|---|---|---|--|---|--|
| IDP | 7 | h | Do people granted stat status have access to pr education? | the same treatment as is | In Bulgaria, school education is mandatory for children under 16 years old. This means that children who are granted stateless status shall have access to primary education. However, there might be practical obstacles, if the child doesn't have a residence permit, a registration card as an asylum seeker or an identity document as a beneficiary of international protection. In this case the child will not be able to receive a certificate or a diploma for the completed education. | Foundation for Access to Rights - FAR, "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention in Bulgaria", p.5, http://www.farbg.eu/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/1221 ENS Detention Reports_Bulgaria_5.pdf |
| IDP | 7 | i | Do people granted stat status have access to secondary a higher educ | accorded to foreigners generally in the same circumstances, with respect to | There are no special rules concerning stateless persons and no explicit rights follow from the fact of being granted stateless status. Secondary education in state schools is free of charge for third-country nationals who have a continuous, long-term or permanent residence permit, as well as for asylum seekers and beneficiaries of international protection. With regard to higher education, third-country nationals have access as a general rule. Each university has its own admission rules. Third-country nationals might be required to pay higher tuition fees. If the stateless person doesn't have an identity document, he/she will not have access to higher education. If the person doesn't have a residence permit, a registration card as an asylum seeker or an identity document as a beneficiary of | Foundation for Access to Rights - FAR, "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention in Bulgaria", p.5, http://www.farbg.eu/wp- content/uploads/2016/07/1221 ENS Detention Reports Bulgaria 5.pdf Law on School and Pre-school Education, Article 9(2)(3)a&e, https://www.lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2136641509 (B) Law on Higher Education, Article 95(8), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2133647361 (B) |

| | | | | | remission of fees and charges and the award of scholarships. | international protection, he/she will not be able to receive a certificate or a diploma for the completed education. | |
|-----|---|---|-----------------------------|--|---|--|---|
| IDP | 7 | j | | Do people granted stateless status have access to social welfare and healthcare? | UN Convention Relating to the Status of Stateless Persons, 1954: (Art. 23, 24) UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: Recognition of an individual as a stateless person under the 1954 Convention also triggers the "lawfully staying" rights, in addition to a right to residence. Thus, the right to work, access to healthcare and social assistance, as well as a travel document must accompany a residence permit. | There are no special provisions concerning people granted stateless status in the Law on Social Assistance and in the Law on Health Insurance. In principle third-country nationals and stateless persons with a long-term or permanent residence permit and beneficiaries of international protection are subject to mandatory health insurance. During the asylum procedure, asylum seekers are insured by the State Agency for Refugees. In principle third-country nationals with a long-term or permanent residence permit and beneficiaries of international protection are eligible for social assistance under the general Law on Social Assistance. | Law on Social Assistance, Article 2(6), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134405633 (B) Law on Health Insurance, Article 33(1)(3), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134412800 (B) |
| IDP | 8 | a | Access to citizenship (SDP) | Are stateless people able to naturalise as citizens? In what timeframe? | UN Convention Relating to the Status of Stateless Persons, 1954 (Art. 32): The Contracting States shall as far as possible facilitate the | Yes. The Law on Bulgarian Citizenship provides that stateless persons are entitled to submit an application for Bulgarian citizenship after completing three years as holders of a permanent or long-term residence permit. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 12 &14, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |

| | | | | assimilation and | | |
|-----|---|---|---------------------|------------------------------------|---|--|
| | | | | naturalisation of stateless | | |
| | | | | persons. They shall in | | |
| | | | | particular make every effort | | |
| | | | | to expedite naturalisation | | |
| | | | | proceedings and to reduce as | | |
| | | | | far as possible the charges | | |
| | | | | and costs of such proceedings. | | |
| | | | | <u>UNHCR (Good Practices Paper</u> | | |
| | | | | 6): It is recommended that | | |
| | | | | States Parties facilitate, as far | | |
| | | | | as possible, the naturalisation | | |
| | | | | of stateless persons. This may | | |
| | | | | be achieved, e.g. by reducing | | |
| | | | | or waiving residence, income | | |
| | | | | and language requirements | | |
| | | | | for applicants and by | | |
| | | | | exempting them from fees or | | |
| | | | | the obligation to provide | | |
| | | | | documentary evidence. | | |
| | | | If stateless people | UN Convention Relating to the | Yes. The Law on Bulgarian Citizenship provides | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 12 & 14, |
| | | | can naturalise, | Status of Stateless Persons, | that stateless persons are entitled to submit an | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |
| | | | are there | <u>1954</u> (Art. 32): as above. | application for Bulgarian citizenship after | |
| | | | accelerated | <u>UNHCR (Good Practices Paper</u> | completing three years as holders of a | |
| | | | naturalisation | <u>6):</u> as above. | permanent or long-term residence permit. In | |
| | | | procedures (e.g. | ENS (2013), Statelessness | comparison, the general rule is that a foreign | |
| | | | reduced | Determination and the | national is entitled to submit an application for | |
| IDP | 8 | h | qualification | Protection of Stateless | Bulgarian citizenship once she/he has | |
| IDP | ٥ | b | periods) which | Persons: a summary guide of | completed five years as a holder of the | |
| | | | apply to stateless | good practices:the main | residence permit. | |
| | | | persons? If yes, | benchmark is whether there is | | |
| | | | please provide | any preferential treatment for | | |
| | | | comparative | stateless persons as compared | | |
| | | | timeframes for | to the general rules applied to | | |
| | | | naturalisation in | those with a foreign | | |
| | | | other situations. | nationality | | |

| IDP | 9 | С | Are previous criminal convictions a bar to naturalisation? If yes, please describe the requirement. Is there a good character clause (separate from | Council of the European Union, Conclusions of the Council and the Representatives of the Governments of the Member States on Statelessness, December 2015: Each state should facilitate the acquisition of its nationality by stateless persons lawfully and habitually resident on its territory, and: d) ensure that offences, when they are relevant for the decision concerning the acquisition of nationality, do not unreasonably prevent | Yes. An applicant for Bulgarian citizenship shall not have been convicted of a premeditated crime of a general nature by a Bulgarian court and against him/her there shall be no criminal proceedings for such a crime, unless the applicant is rehabilitated. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 12(1)(3) & Article 14, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |
|-----|---|---|---|---|--|--|
| IDP | 9 | c | requirement. Is there a good character clause | they are relevant for the decision concerning the acquisition of nationality, do | | |
| | | | | punishment to the individual who committed a crime. | | |
| IDP | 9 | d | Is there a citizenship/integr ation test? | ENS (2013), Statelessness Determination and the Protection of Stateless Persons: a summary guide of good practices:the main benchmark is whether there is any preferential treatment for stateless persons as compared to the general rules | The candidate for Bulgarian citizenship shall have income or occupation, which gives him/her the opportunity to support himself/herself in the Republic of Bulgaria and shall know the Bulgarian language. The knowledge of the Bulgarian language is determined in accordance with an Ordinance of the Minister of Education. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 12(1)(4) & (5) & Article 14, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |

| IDP | 9 | е | Are there language requirement exemptions for stateless people? | UNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6): It isrecommended that States Parties facilitate, as far as possible, the naturalisation of stateless personsfor example, by reducing or waiving residence, income and language requirementsand by exempting them from fees or the obligation to provide documentary evidence. Council of the European Union, Conclusions of the Council and the Representatives of the Governments of the Member States on Statelessness, December 2015: as above ENS (2013), Statelessness Determination and the Protection of Stateless Persons: a summary guide of good practices: as above. | No, there are no language requirement exemptions for stateless people. An applicant for Bulgarian citizenship shall prove that she/he has knowledge of the Bulgarian language. The language exam to determine proficiency in the Bulgarian language is free of charge for all foreign nationals. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 12 & Article 14, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) Centre for Assessment of Pre-School and School Education, http://www.ckoko.bg/page.php?c=24&d=19 (B) |
|-----|---|---|--|--|--|---|
| IDP | 9 | f | Are there income exemptions for stateless persons if a level of income is required for naturalization? | UNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6): as above. | No, there are no income exemptions for stateless persons. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 12 & Article 14, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592(B) |

Detention

| Cat | Q | Sub | Subtheme | Question | International Norms / Good Practice | Answer | Source |
|-----|---|-----|------------------------|---|---|--|--|
| DET | 1 | а | Detention screening | Are immigration detention powers provided for in law? | • ICCPR Art 9 (1): Everyone has the right to liberty and security of person. No one shall be subjected to arbitrary arrest or detention. No one shall be deprived of his liberty except on such grounds and in accordance with such procedure as are established by law. ECHR Art 5 (1): Everyone has the right to liberty and security of person. No one shall be deprived of his liberty save in the following cases and in accordance with a procedure prescribed by law: (f) the lawful arrest or detention of a person to prevent his effecting an unauthorised entry into the country or of a person against whom action is being taken with a view to deportation or extradition. | Yes. Immigration detention is provided for in the Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria (LFRB). | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 44(6) & (13), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| DET | 1 | b | | Does domestic law allow immigration detention for purposes other than those allowed under ECHR 5(1)(f)? | ECHR Art 5 (1)(f) | Yes. Besides immigration detention of persons against whom action is being taken with a view to return or expulsion (Article 44(6) LFRB), in December 2016 a new type of detention was introduced in Article 44(13), so-called 'short-term' detention lasting for up to thirty days. The purpose is to conduct initial establishment of identity and assess the subsequent administrative measures to be taken by the authorities. | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 44(6) & (13), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |

| DET | 1 | С | Does a proposed country of removal need to be identified before a person is detained for the purpose of removal? Please describe the situation in law and in practice. | ICCPR Art 7: Repeated attempts to expel a person to a country that is refusing to admit the individual in question could amount to inhuman or degrading treatment. ECHR Art 5 (1)(f) Auad v Bulgaria [2011] Application no 46390/10 (ECtHR):the only issue is whether or not the authorities were sufficiently diligent in their efforts to deport the applicant. EU Returns Directive: Any detention shall be for as short a period as possible and only maintained as long as removal arrangements are in progress and executed with due diligence. ECRE, Point of No Return: The Futile Detention of Unreturnable Migrants, 2014: Once un-returnability is established, migrants should not be detained. | Neither in law nor in practice is the proposed country of removal identified before a person is detained for the purpose of removal. Both the removal and detention order state the country of citizenship of the person only. According to the answer of the Migration Directorate to a freedom of information request by FAR, the country of citizenship is stated based on the information acquired at the time of issuance of the orders. By amendment in the Law on Foreign Nationals as of December 2016, the return decision may concern either of the three options: return to "a country of origin", "a country of transit" or "a third country". However, the return orders only state the type of return, but not the concrete country applicable to the case. Previously the law referred to the return measure as "coercive taking to the border". | Law on the Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 39a(1)(2)&(3); Article 44(6), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) European Court of Human Rights, Judgment on the Case of Auad v. Bulgaria (Application no. 46390/10), 11 October 2011, Para.139, http://www.asylumlawdatabase.eu/en/content/ecthr-auad-v-bulgaria-application-no-4639010 European Court of Human Rights, Judgment on the Case of Amie and Others v. Bulgaria (Application no. 58149/08), 12 February 2013, Para.77, http://www.asylumlawdatabase.eu/en/content/ecthr-amie-and-others-v-bulgaria-application-no-5814908 Foundation for Access to Rights - FAR, "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention in Bulgaria", p.14 & 19, http://www.farbg.eu/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/1221 ENS Detention Reports Bulgaria 5.pdf Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |
|-----|---|---|--|---|---|--|
| | | | Is statelessness a juridically relevant fact in | Auad v Bulgaria [2011] Application no 46390/10 (ECtHR): as above. | National law does not explicitly require the authorities to take statelessness into account. When imposing the compulsory | Law on the Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 44(2) & (7), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| DET | 1 | d | any decision to detain (in practice and in law)? If so, at what point(s) is a risk of statelessness | Mikolenko v. Estonia, Application no. 10664/05, 8 October 2009 (ECtHR): Detention is justified as long as "deportation proceedings are being conducted" and these | administrative measures, the competent authorities shall take into account "the duration of the residence of the foreigner in the Republic of Bulgaria, the categories of vulnerable persons, the existence of proceedings under the Law on Asylum and Refugees or proceedings for renewal of the | Foundation for Access to Rights - FAR, "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention in Bulgaria", p. 14, http://www.farbg.eu/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/1221 ENS Detention Reports Bulgaria 5.pdf |

identified? Is proceedings must be carried out residence permit or other authorisation referral to an with due diligence... offering a right of residence, the person's Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to SDP possible UNHCR (2014), Handbook on family situation, and the existence of family, provide access to public information, Ministry within the cultural and social ties with the country of of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. Protection of Stateless Persons: detention Routine detention of individuals origin". In a freedom of information request regime? seeking protection on the FAR asked the Ministry of Interior whether grounds of statelessness is statelessness is a relevant fact in issuing the arbitrary... the absence of status detention order. The Migration Directorate determination procedures to replied that the detention order only serves a verify identity or nationality can removal order that is already in place and lead to prolonged or indefinite should have taken all relevant facts into detention. SDPs are therefore consideration. The General Directorate of an important mechanism to Border Police replied that, after having taken reduce the risk of prolonged into consideration all relevant circumstances, and/or arbitrary detention. a detention order may be issued to a Equal Rights Trust (ERT) (2012), stateless person. Asked whether referral to **Guidelines to Protect Stateless** the SDP is possible within the detention Persons from Arbitrary regime, the Migration Directorate replied Detention: Guideline 13 – states that "applying for the status of a stateless must identify stateless persons person is a personal choice of every foreign within their territory or subject national". Although it is currently uncertain to their jurisdiction as a first how this would happen in practice, one could step towards ensuring the argue that a submission of an application protection of their human under the SDP from a detention centre would be in compliance with the law. The law rights. International Commission of requires that the application is submitted in Jurists. Migration and person at the Migration Directorate. The International Human Rights Law: migrant detention centres are part of the a Practitioner's Guide 2014: the Migration Directorate. detention of stateless persons can never be justified when there is 'no active or realistic progress towards transfer to another State'.

| DET | 1 | e | Are stateless people detained in practice? Please provide figures and source of information if available. | As above. | Yes. Official data provided by the Migration Directorate in 2016: In 2007, 1 stateless person was detained; 2008, 9; 2009, 6; 2010, 10; 2011, 5; 2012, 26; 2013, 38; 2014, 11; 2015, 31; As of 15 June 2016, 3. Official data provided by the Migration Directorate in 2018: "In 2016 one foreign national who defined himself/herself as stateless was detained; In 2017 three foreign nationals who defined themselves as stateless were detained. As of 21 May 2018, two persons who defined themselves as stateless were detained." | Decision No. 212164 - 54 of 21 June 2016 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. Decision No.812104- 135 of 8 June 2018 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |
|-----|---|---|--|--|---|--|
| DET | 1 | f | Does law (and/or policy) provide that immigration detention should be used only as a last resort, after all alternatives to detention have been exhausted? | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: Detention is therefore a measure of last resort and can only be justified where other less invasive or coercive measures have been considered and found insufficient to safeguard the lawful governmental objective pursued by detention. EU Returns Directive: Art 15(1) Unless other sufficient but less coercive measures can be applied effectively in a specific case, Member States may only keep in detention a third-country national who is the subject of return procedures in order to prepare the return and/or carry out the removal process. | Yes, according to the law detention is a measure of last resort. However, in practice there is almost automatic imposition of both removal and detention orders upon identification of an irregularly present migrant in Bulgaria. | Law on the Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 44(5)&(6), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) Foundation for Access to Rights - FAR, "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention in Bulgaria", p.21 & 24, http://www.farbg.eu/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/1221 ENS Detention Reports Bulgaria 5.pdf Bulgarian Helsinki Committee's synthesis report in their EPIM-funded project 'Free to Go: Detention as a last, not a first resort', http://www.bghelsinki.org/media/uploads/documents/reports/special/2016-10 Detention mapping report 2016 EN.pdf |

| | | | | | ENS (2015) Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention: a regional toolkit for practitioners: Arbitrary and | Article 44(2) LFRB requires the authority to carry out a vulnerability assessment. However, in practice despite recognition of different types of vulnerability by law, in the | Decision No.212164-54 of 21 June 2016 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria |
|-----|---|---|--|--|---|---|---|
| DET | 1 | g | | Are individual vulnerability assessments carried out before a decision to detain (or shortly thereafter), and are stateless persons defined as a vulnerable group? | | · · · | · |
| | | | | | | torture, rape or other serious forms of psychological, physical or sexual violence". | |
| DET | 2 | а | Alternatives to immigration detention | Does the country have alternatives to detention which individuals | ICCPR Art 9 FKAG v Australia (HRC): Any decision relating to detention must take into account less | Yes, Bulgaria has alternatives to detention that shall, by law, be considered prior to detention: 1) weekly reporting; | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 44(5), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |

| | | are considered | invasive means of achieving the | 2) financial guarantee and | |
|--|--|------------------|----------------------------------|--|--|
| | | for prior to any | same ends | 3) surrender of a valid passport or another | |
| | | decision to | UN General Assembly | travel document as a temporary pledge. | |
| | | detain? Are | Resolution on the protection of | The alternative measures could be applied | |
| | | alternatives to | migrants 63/184 2009: Calls | together or separately. The financial | |
| | | detention | upon all States to adopt, | guarantee and the temporary pledge of a | |
| | | established in | where applicable, alternative | travel document were introduced for the first | |
| | | law? Are they | measures to detention. | time in the law with the amendments of | |
| | | subject to a | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | December 2017. The LFRB does not provide | |
| | | statutory time | Protection of Stateless Persons: | for a statutory time limit for alternatives to | |
| | | limit and | Detentioncan only be justified | detention nor a proportionality test. | |
| | | proportionality | where other less invasive or | | |
| | | test? | coercive measures have been | | |
| | | | considered and found | | |
| | | | insufficient | | |
| | | | UNHCR (2012), Guidelines on | | |
| | | | Applicable Criteria and | | |
| | | | Standards relating to the | | |
| | | | Detention of Asylum-Seekers | | |
| | | | and Alternatives to Detention: | | |
| | | | alternatives to detention refers | | |
| | | | to any legislation, policy or | | |
| | | | practice that allows asylum- | | |
| | | | seekers to reside in the | | |
| | | | community subject to a number | | |
| | | | of conditions or restrictions on | | |
| | | | their freedom of movement and | | |
| | | | since they can involve | | |
| | | | restrictions on movement of | | |
| | | | liberty they are bound by | | |
| | | | human right standards. | | |
| | | | Human Rights Council (HRC), | | |
| | | | Report of the Special | | |
| | | | Rapporteur on the human rights | | |
| | | | of migrants, François Crépeau | | |
| | | | (2012) A/HRC/20/24: | | |
| | | | Alternatives to detention should | | |
| | | | not become alternatives to | | |

| unconditional release [] the | |
|--|--|
| obligation to always consider | |
| alternatives to detention (non- | |
| custodial measures) before | |
| resorting to detention should be | |
| established by law. | |
| Council of Europe (2005), | |
| Twenty Guidelines of the | |
| Committee of Ministers of | |
| Europe on Forced Return: After | |
| a careful examination of the | |
| necessity of deprivation of | |
| liberty in each individual case, | |
| the authoritieshave concluded | |
| that compliance with the | |
| removal order cannot be | |
| ensured as effectively by | |
| resorting to non-custodial | |
| measures | |
| EU Returns Directive: Art 15(1) | |
| Unless other sufficient but less | |
| coercive measures can be | |
| applied effectively in a specific | |
| case, Member States may only | |
| keep in detention a third- | |
| country national who is the | |
| subject of return procedures in | |
| order to prepare the return | |
| and/or carry out the removal | |
| process. | |
| Equal Rights Trust (ERT) (2012), | |
| <u>Guidelines to Protect Stateless</u> | |
| Persons from Arbitrary | |
| <u>Detention:</u> (31)states have an | |
| obligation in the first instance to | |
| consider and apply appropriate | |
| and viable alternatives to | |

| | ve and intrusive |
|---|--|
| • Intern | |
| | ional Detention |
| Coalitio | 2015), There Are |
| Alternat | es: A handbook for |
| prevent | <u>g unnecessary</u> |
| immigra | on detention (revised |
| <u>edition</u>) | mmigration detention |
| | used only as a last |
| | xceptional cases after |
| | ptions have been ptions |
| | be inadequate in the |
| individu | |
| As abov | In 2016 the Foundation for Access to Rights Foundation for Access to Rights - FAR, |
| | (FAR) conducted two field studies, in which "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary |
| | individual detainees were interviewed and Detention in Bulgaria", p. 24, |
| | their cases documented and analysed: http://www.farbg.eu/wp- |
| | 1) "Protecting Stateless Persons from content/uploads/2016/07/1221_ENS_Detentio |
| | Arbitrary Detention in Bulgaria" concluded n Reports Bulgaria 5.pdf |
| | that "alternatives are sought, only after |
| | removal has not been possible within a |
| Is there evidence | reasonable period of time and/or only upon a FAR, Analytical report on the exercise by |
| that immigration | subsequent application by the person who detained immigrants of the right to be heard in |
| detention is used | has already been placed in detention". Bulgaria, Section III.1, |
| DET 2 b in practice prior to all alternatives | 2) "Analytical report on the exercise by detained immigrants of the right to be heard collection/analytical-report/ |
| | detained immigrants of the right to be heard in Bulgaria" found that: "none of the |
| being considered? | interviewees were granted a period for |
| Please cite | voluntary compliance with the return |
| relevant reports. | obligation prior to ordering detention. |
| relevant reports. | Furthermore, the administrative body failed |
| | to consider the presence of any circumstances |
| | justifying detention as a measure of last |
| | resort as compared to other available |
| | alternatives in each case. None of the |
| | decisions on detention on immigration |
| | grounds contain an analysis or reasons for |
| | the choice of detention as compared to less |

| | | | | | | coercive alternatives nor an explanation why | |
|-----|---|---|------------|------------------|--|--|---|
| | | | | | | such alternatives would not be effective." | |
| | | | | | | 33 | |
| | | | | | UN Human Rights Council (HRC) | Yes. The maximum period for immigration | Law on the Foreign Nationals in the Republic of |
| | | | | | (2010), Report of the UN | detention for the purpose of removal is 18 | Bulgaria, Article 44(8)&(13), |
| | | | | | Working Group on Arbitrary | months. The maximum period for the so | https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| | | | | | Detention to the Human Rights | called "short-term" detention is 30 calendar | |
| | | | | | Council, 13th Session, | days. | |
| | | | | | A/HRC/13/30: a maximum | | |
| | | | | | period of detention must be | | |
| | | | | | established by law and upon | | |
| | | | | | expirythe detainee must be | | |
| | | | | | automatically released. | | |
| | | | | | UNHCR (2012), Guidelines on | | |
| | | | | | Applicable Criteria and | | |
| | | | | | Standards relating to the | | |
| | | | | | Detention of Asylum-Seekers | | |
| | | | | Is there a | and Alternatives to Detention: | | |
| | | | | maximum time | to guard against arbitrariness, | | |
| DET | 3 | а | Procedural | period for | maximum periods of detention | | |
| " | | " | safeguards | immigration | should be set in national law. | | |
| | | | | detention set in | EU Returns Directive: Art 15(5) | | |
| | | | | law? What is it? | Each Member State shall set a | | |
| | | | | | limited period of detention | | |
| | | | | | ENS (2015) Protecting Stateless | | |
| | | | | | Persons from Arbitrary | | |
| | | | | | <u>Detention: a regional toolkit for</u> | | |
| | | | | | <u>practitioners:</u> It is desirable that | | |
| | | | | | states clearly specify a | | |
| | | | | | reasonable maximum time limit. | | |
| | | | | | Equal Rights Trust (ERT) (2012), | | |
| | | | | | Guidelines to Protect Stateless | | |
| | | | | | Persons from Arbitrary | | |
| | | | | | <u>Detention:</u> Guideline 39: | | |
| | | | | | Detention should always be for | | |
| | | | | | the shortest time possible. | | |
| | | | | 1 | There should be a reasonable | | |

| DET | 3 | b | Does law/policy provide that individuals must be informed in writing of the reasons for immigration detention? Are detainees provided with information on their rights, contact details of legal advice and support providers, and guidance on how to access an SDP? | maximum time-limit for detention UN General Assembly (UNGA) (1988), Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment, Resolution A/RES/43/173: Anyone who is arrested shall be informed at the time of his arrest of the reason for his arrest and shall be promptly informed of any charges against him. EU Returns Directive: Detention shall be ordered in writing with reasons being given in fact and in law. Equal Rights Trust (ERT) (2012), Guidelines to Protect Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention: Guideline 37: Stateless detainees shall receive their order of detention in writing and in a language they understand, and this must outline the reasons for their detention Detainees must be informed of their rights International Commission of Jurists (ICJ) (2014), Migration and International Human Rights Law: a Practitioner's Guide (updated edition): The authorities are required to | Under the general rules of the Code on Administrative Procedure, the written decision to detain, which by law is an administrative act, shall state the factual and legal grounds on which it is based. However due to the lack of interpreters, detainees often do not understand the reasons for detention. According to the analytical report in the HEAR project, an interpreter was present in 3 out of 30 cases that were followed: "Despite this, the detained immigrants were not able to challenge the orders because they did not understand their rights and were not informed that they had the right to receive legal aid". In June 2018, in its reply to afreedom of information request by FAR, the Migration Directorate stated that detainees "have access to information about contacts of various organisations providing legal and other assistance". In 2018, UNHCR in Bulgaria produced a video with information on applying for asylum in Bulgaria, which will be aired in the detention centres in the country. | Administrative Procedure Code, Article 59(2)(4), https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135521015 (B) FAR, Analytical report on the exercise by detained immigrants of the right to be heard in Bulgaria, September 2016, http://hear.farbg.eu/evidence-collection/analytical-report/# ftn43 European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, Report to the Bulgarian Government on the visit to Bulgaria carried out by the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT) from 25 September to 6 October 2017, p. 33, https://rm.coe.int/16807c4b74?utm_source=EC RE+Newsletters&utm_campaign=9ebbfa0fe1-EMAIL_CAMPAIGN_2018_05_25_03_06&utm_medium=email&utm_term=0_3ec9497afd-9ebbfa0fe1-422288889 Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to provide access to public information, Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |
|-----|---|---|--|--|---|---|
| | | | | and International Human Rights Law: a Practitioner's Guide | | |

| | | | | nature of their detention, the reasons for it, the process for reviewing or challenging the decision to detain. EU Returns Directive: Any | By law, the Director of the Migration | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of |
|-----|---|---|---|---|--|--|
| DET | 3 | C | Are there regular periodic reviews of the necessity for the continuation of detention before a court or an independent body? If yes, are detainees released when it becomes evident that their removal will not be possible within a reasonable time? | detention shall only be maintained as long as removal arrangements are in progress and executed with due diligence. Auad v Bulgaria [2011] Application no 46390/10 (ECtHR):the only issue is whether or not the authorities were sufficiently diligent in their efforts to deport the applicant the length of the detention should not exceed that reasonably required for the purpose pursued. Kim v Russia [2014] Application no 44260/13 (ECtHR): The purpose of Art 5(4) ECHR is to guarantee to persons who are arrested and detained the right to judicial supervision of the lawfulness of the measure A. v. Australia, CCPR/C/59/D/560/1993, (HRC): Decisions to detain should be open to review periodically Saïd Shamilovich Kadzoev v Direktsia Migratsia' priMinisterstvo na vatreshniteraboti [2009] Case C-357/09 (ECJ): There must, at the | Directorate shall carry out official inspections every month to check whether the grounds for detention still exist. If it is established that there is no longer any reasonable prospect for removal, the person shall be released immediately. However, the practice differs from the law. For example, in Auad v Bulgaria, the applicant was a stateless person who spent 18 months in detention. The Court concluded that the Bulgarian authorities could "hardly be regarded as having taken active and diligent steps" in relation to the deportation of the detainee. In its 2016 study FAR found that: "In the majority of cases the burden of proof has been shifted to the detainee to prove that there is no reasonable prospect of removal". The Bulgarian Lawyers for Human Rights Foundation has analysed Bulgarian case law on immigration detention between January 2013 to September 2015. Their conclusion is that "in most of the reviewed judicial acts, the court was satisfied that it formally found a theoretical, abstract possibility of removal by noting that no evidence has been provided that there is no reasonable prospect of removal for legal and other considerations, instead of requiring the authorities to specifically indicate data, from which it is clear that removal is realistic and will happen in the foreseeable future, as soon as possible". The maximum period for initial | Bulgaria, Article 44(8), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) Auad v Bulgaria (2011) Application no 46390/10 (ECtHR) Foundation for Access to Rights - FAR, "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention in Bulgaria", p.21 & 23, http://www.farbg.eu/wp- content/uploads/2016/07/1221 ENS Detentio n_Reports_Bulgaria_5.pdf |

| | | | | (.) | 1 6 11 -1. | |
|-----|---|---|------------------|--|---|--|
| | | | | time of the national Court's | detention for removal is up to 6 months. This | |
| | | | | review of the lawfulness of | period may be extended for 12 additional | |
| | | | | detention, be a real prospect | months when the foreign national refuses to | |
| | | | | that the removal can be carried | assist the competent authorities or there is a | |
| | | | | out successfully. | delay in obtaining the necessary documents | |
| | | | | Council of Europe (2005), | for return. | |
| | | | | Twenty Guidelines of the | | |
| | | | | Committee of Ministers of | | |
| | | | | Europe on Forced Return: | | |
| | | | | Detention pending removal shall | | |
| | | | | be justified only for as long as | | |
| | | | | removal arrangements are in | | |
| | | | | progress. | | |
| | | | | Equal Rights Trust (ERT) (2012), | | |
| | | | | <u>Guidelines to Protect Stateless</u> | | |
| | | | | Persons from Arbitrary | | |
| | | | | Detention: Guideline 41: To | | |
| | | | | avoid arbitrariness, detention | | |
| | | | | should be subject to automatic, | | |
| | | | | regular and periodic review | | |
| | | | | throughout the period of | | |
| | | | | detention, before a judicial body | | |
| | | | | independent of the detaining | | |
| | | | | authorities. | | |
| | | | | ICCPR Art 9(4): Anyone who is | The detainee is entitled to submit an appeal | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of |
| | | | | deprived of his liberty by arrest | against the detention order within 14 days | Bulgaria, Article 46a, |
| | | | What remedies | or detention shall be entitled to | from the date of detention. A significant | https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| | | | are available to | take proceedings before a | hurdle to accessing judicial review is that the | |
| | | | an individual to | court | period for exercising the right to appeal | Foundation for Access to Rights - FAR, |
| | | | challenge | ECHR: Everyone who is deprived | starts from the moment the person is | "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary |
| DET | 3 | d | detention? How | of his liberty by arrest or | detained, not from the moment they are | Detention in Bulgaria", p.21, |
| | , | ١ | often can these | detention shall be entitled to | notified about the order. The next obstacle is | http://www.farbg.eu/wp- |
| | | | be invoked? Are | take proceedings by which the | that the detention order is in Bulgarian and | content/uploads/2016/07/1221_ENS_Detentio |
| | | | there any | lawfulness of his detention shall | people often sign the orders without | n Reports Bulgaria 5.pdf |
| | | | obstacles in | be decided speedily by a | knowing the remedies against detention. | |
| | | | practice? | court | Another obstacle is that detainees have to | |
| | | | | Kim v Russia [2014] Application | find and engage a lawyer by themselves. | |
| | | | | no 44260/13 (ECtHR): the | Although in 2013 the law was amended to | |

| • | 1 | 1 | 1 | ı | | | |
|-----|---|---|---|-------------------|--|--|--|
| | | | | | purpose of Art 5(4) ECHR is to | introduce a right to legal aid for immigration | |
| | | | | | guarantee to persons who are | detainees, access has remained difficult and | |
| | | | | | arrested and detained the right | the new provisions have not been applied in | |
| | | | | | to judicial supervision of the | practice. Even if an appeal against a | |
| | | | | | lawfulness of the measure | detention order reaches the court, the law | |
| | | | | | | provides that participation of the detainee in | |
| | | | | | | the case "is not obligatory". | |
| | | | | | Auad v Bulgaria [2011] | In the national legislation there is no such | Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to |
| | | | | Are there | Application no 46390/10 | guidance. Miscellaneous rules that might be | provide access to public information, Ministry |
| | | | | rules/guidance in | (ECtHR): The only issue is | relevant to the issue could be found in | of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria |
| | | | | place that | whether or not the authorities | readmission agreements. FAR asked the | |
| | | | | govern the | were sufficiently diligent in their | question in a freedom of information request | |
| | | | | process of re- | efforts to deport the applicant. | addressed to the Ministry of the Interior. The | |
| | | | | documentation | Equal Rights Trust (ERT) (2012), | Migration Directorate replied that these rules | |
| | | | | and/or | Guidelines to Protect Stateless | are "those established in the law" without | |
| | | | | ascertaining | Persons from Arbitrary | further explanation. | |
| | | | | entitlement to | Detention: The inability of a | | |
| | | | | nationality for | stateless person to cooperate | | |
| | | | | the purpose of | with removal proceedings | | |
| | | | | removal? Do | should not be treated as non- | | |
| | | | | these articulate | cooperation. | | |
| DET | 3 | е | | the respective | ENS (2015) Protecting Stateless | | |
| | | | | roles that state | Persons from Arbitrary | | |
| | | | | and individual | Detention: a regional toolkit for | | |
| | | | | are expected to | practitioners: The detaining | | |
| | | | | play? Are there | state should have rules in place | | |
| | | | | time limits | that govern the process of re- | | |
| | | | | clearly set out? | documentation and/ or | | |
| | | | | Are the | ascertaining entitlement to | | |
| | | | | outcomes | nationality | | |
| | | | | considered | ECRE, Point of No Return: The | | |
| | | | | relevant for | <u>Futile Detention of</u> | | |
| | | | | subsequent | Unreturnable Migrants, 2014: | | |
| | | | | determination of | Once un-returnability is | | |
| | | | | statelessness? | established, migrants should not | | |
| | | | | | be detained. | | |

| | | ı | 1 | | | | |
|-----|---|---|-------------|-------------------|--|--|--|
| | | | | | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | The law provides for a right to state-funded | Law on Legal Aid, Article 22(1)(9), |
| | | | | | <u>Protection of Stateless Persons</u> : | legal aid to challenge immigration detention. | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135511185 |
| | | | | | Judicial oversight of detention is | In practice, access to the possibilities under | |
| | | | | Is free legal aid | always necessary and detained | the law is still hampered by bureaucratic | Foundation for Access to Rights - FAR, |
| | | | | available to | individuals need to have access | obstacles such as cumbersome procedures | "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary |
| | | | | challenge | to legal representation, | for granting legal aid, language barriers, low | Detention in Bulgaria", p.21, |
| DET | 3 | f | | detention? Are | including free counselling for | awareness of the rights of stateless persons, | http://www.farbg.eu/wp- |
| DET | 3 | ' | | there any | those without means. | lack of expertise, etc. These obstacles could | content/uploads/2016/07/1221 ENS Detentio |
| | | | | barriers to | EU Returns Directive: Art 13(3) | be overcome by raising awareness among | n_Reports_Bulgaria_5.pdf |
| | | | | accessing this in | The third-country national | immigration detainees, the authorities and | |
| | | | | practice? | concerned shall have the | the lawyers at the National Legal Aid Bureau | |
| | | | | | possibility to obtain legal advice, | on the available rights and obligations of | |
| | | | | | representation and, where | immigration detainees. | |
| | | | | | necessary, linguistic assistance. | | |
| | | | | | UN Convention Relating to the | No, detainees are released without identity | Foundation for Access to Rights - FAR, |
| | | | | | Status of Stateless Persons, | documents, which increases the risk of re- | "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary |
| | | | | | <u>1954:</u> Art 27 | detention. In a 2016 study by FAR: "For | Detention in Bulgaria", p. 27, |
| | | | | | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on | example, during the interview at the National | http://www.farbg.eu/wp- |
| | | | | | <u>Protection of Stateless Persons</u> : | Commission on Combatting Trafficking in | content/uploads/2016/07/1221_ENS_Detentio |
| | | | | | being undocumented or | Human Beings (NCTHB) the expert recalled | n Reports Bulgaria 5.pdf |
| | | | | Are those | lacking the necessary | the case of a stateless lady who was | |
| | | | | released from | immigration permits cannot be | repeatedly detained in the Bousmantsi | |
| | | | | detention issued | used as a general justification | detention centre. She was a victim of | |
| | | | | with any | for detention | trafficking and had suffered physical abuse. | |
| | | | | identification, | ENS (2015) Protecting Stateless | As a result, she suffered from dissociative | |
| DET | 4 | а | Protections | including | Persons from Arbitrary | psychosis. In September 2013 she was | |
| DEI | 4 | а | on release | confirmation of | Detention: a regional toolkit for | transferred from the Bousmantsi detention | |
| | | | | their stateless | practitioners:state parties to | centre to a shelter of the NCTHB. In the | |
| | | | | status, and thus | the 1954 Convention have an | meantime, the Migration Directorate | |
| | | | | protected from | obligation to provide stay rights | continued to investigate her citizenship. She | |
| | | | | arbitrary re- | to stateless persons who have | was not provided with identity documents. In | |
| | | | | detention? | been released from detention. | 2014 the shelters of the NCTHB were | |
| | | | | | Equal Rights Trust (ERT) (2012), | temporarily closed and the stateless lady was | |
| | | | | | Guidelines to Protect Stateless | again detained in the Bousmantsi detention | |
| | | | | | Persons from Arbitrary | centre." | |
| | | | | | <u>Detention:</u> Guidelines 55 & 56: | | |
| | | | | | Released stateless detainees | | |
| | | | | | should be provided with | | |

| DET | 4 | b | | If the purpose of detention cannot be fulfilled (e.g. removal) and the person is released, what legal status is provided to them by law? Can they access social security accommodation, education and healthcare? Do they have the right to work? | appropriate documentation and stay rights suitable to their situation. Saïd Shamilovich Kadzoev v Direktsia Migratsia' pri Ministerstvo na vatreshnite raboti [2009] Case C-357/09 (ECJ): Article 15(4) and (6) of the Directive should be interpreted as requiring that after the maximum period of detention has expired, the person must be released immediately the individual's lack of valid documentation, his/her inability to support him/herself or his/her "aggressive conduct" should not be a deterrent to his/her release. Equal Rights Trust (ERT) (2012), Guidelines to Protect Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention: Guideline 55 as above. | No legal status is provided to former detainees. The Bulgarian law provides for no regularisation mechanism in such cases. The person continues to be an undocumented migrant without access to social security, accommodation, education and healthcare. Only in cases of expulsion orders issued on national security or public orders grounds, the LFRB states that the person shall be provided with access to the labour market if the expulsion was not implemented within one year. | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria (LFRB), Article 44a(4), https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) Foundation for Access to Rights - FAR, "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention in Bulgaria", p.26 & 27, http://www.farbg.eu/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/1221_ENS_Detention Reports Bulgaria 5.pdf |
|-----|---|---|------------------------|---|---|--|---|
| DET | 4 | С | | If re-detention does occur, is the cumulative time spent in detention counted towards any maximum time limits? | Equal Rights Trust (ERT) (2012), Guidelines to Protect Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention: Guideline 40: When calculating the total time spent by an individual in detention, it is highly desirable that time spent in detention on previous occasions is taken into consideration. | Yes, the courts count the cumulative time spent in detention towards the time limit of 18 months. | Law on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 44(8), https://lex.bg/bg/laws/ldoc/2134455296 (B) |
| DET | 5 | а | Readmission agreements | Is statelessness considered a juridically relevant fact in | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: Efforts to secure | There are provisions on readmission of stateless persons in the bilateral readmission agreements with Bosnia and Herzegovina, Albania, Macedonia, Armenia, Lebanon and | Article 4(3) of the bilateral readmission agreement with Bosnia and Herzegovina; Article 4(3) of the bilateral readmission agreement with Albania; Article 4 of the bilateral |

| | | | r | | T | 1 |
|------|---|---|-------------------|---------------------------------|--|---|
| | | | any readmission | admission or readmission may | Uzbekistan. According to the bilateral | readmission agreement with Macedonia; Article |
| | | | and/or bilateral | be justified but these need to | readmission agreement with Georgia, the | 3(1) of the bilateral readmission agreement |
| | | | return | take place subsequent to a | contracting parties are not obliged to readmit | with Armenia; Article 4(3) of the bilateral |
| | | | agreements? | determination of statelessness. | stateless persons. In respibse to a freedom of | readmission agreement with Lebanon; Article |
| | | | | | information request, the General Directorate | 4(3) of the bilateral readmission agreement |
| | | | | | 'Border Police' pointed out that all 17 EU- | with Uzbekistan; Article 7(2)b of the bilateral |
| | | | | | level readmission agreements, except those | readmission agreement with Georgia. |
| | | | | | with Macao and Hong Kong, contain clauses | |
| | | | | | allowing the return of stateless persons. The | Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to |
| | | | | | following bilateral readmission agreements | provide access to public information, Ministry |
| | | | | | with EU Member States also provide for | of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |
| | | | | | return of stateless persons: Austria, | |
| | | | | | Germany, Ireland, Italy, Latvia, Lebanon, | |
| | | | | | Poland, Slovenia, Croatia and the Czech | |
| | | | | | Republic. The readmission agreement with | |
| | | | | | Switzerland also refers to stateless persons. | |
| | | | Are you aware of | | In a freedom of information response, the | Decision No. 812104 - 135 of 8 June 2018 to |
| | | | cases of cases of | | General Directorate 'Border Police' replied | provide access to public information, Ministry |
| DET. | _ | | stateless people | | that one stateless person was returned to | of the Interior of the Republic of Bulgaria. |
| DET | 5 | b | being returned | | another EU country based on possession of a | _ |
| | | | under such | | residence permit and refugee status in that | |
| | | | agreements? | | country. | |

Prevention and Reduction

| Cat | Q | Sub | Subtheme | Question | International Norms / Good Practice | Answer | Source |
|-----|---|-----|-----------------------------------|--|---|---|---|
| PRS | 1 | a | Stateless born on territory | Is there a provision in law for stateless children born on the territory to be granted nationality? If yes, continue with PRS1b below. If no, proceed to PRS1j. | UN Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, 1961: A Contracting State shall grant its nationality to a person born in its territory who would otherwise be stateless European Convention on Nationality, 1997: Each State Party shall provide in its internal law for its nationality to be acquired by children born on its territory who do not acquire at birth another nationality Convention on the Rights of the Child 1989: The child shall have the right to acquire a nationality States Parties shall ensure the implementation of these rightsin particular where the child would otherwise be stateless States Parties undertake to respect the right of the child to preserve his or her identity, including nationality Genovese v. Malta (ECthr) Application No. 53124/09, 11 October 2011 | Yes. According to the law, a Bulgarian citizen by birth is every person born on the territory of the Republic of Bulgaria who does not acquire another citizenship by origin. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 10, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |
| PRS | 1 | b | | Is the provision for stateless children to access | UNHCR Guidelines on Statelessness #4 2012: Article 1 of the 1961 Convention | The provision is automatic. Children acquire Bulgarian citizenship under Article 10 of the Law on Bulgarian citizenship <i>ex lege</i> . | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 10, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |

⁵⁵

| | | | nationality | provides Contracting States | | |
|------|---|---|---------------------|-----------------------------------|---|---|
| | | | automatic or non- | with two alternativesfor | | |
| | | | automatic (i.e. by | granting nationality to children | | |
| | | | application)? | who would otherwise be | | |
| | | | application). | stateless born in their | | |
| | | | | territoryeitherautomatic | | |
| | | | | acquisitionupon birth | | |
| | | | | pursuant to Article 1(1)(a), or | | |
| | | | | upon application pursuant to | | |
| | | | | Article 1(1)(b) | | |
| | | | | ENS (2015), No Child Should Be | | |
| | | | | Stateless: Article 1 of the 1961 | | |
| | | | | Convention and article 6(2) of | | |
| | | | | the ECN oblige the conferral | | |
| | | | | of nationality to children born | | |
| | | | | on the territory if they would | | |
| | | | | otherwise be stateless The | | |
| | | | | optimal methodis to grant | | |
| | | | | nationality to otherwise | | |
| | | | | stateless children | | |
| | | | | automatically, at birth. | | |
| | | | | UNHCR Guidelines on | No. According to the law, a Bulgarian citizen | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 10, |
| | | | | Statelessness #4 2012: The test | by birth is every person born on the territory | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |
| | | | | is whether a child is stateless | of the Republic of Bulgaria who does not | |
| | | | | because he or she acquires | acquire another citizenship by origin. This | Judgement No 1424 of 04.08.2017, case No |
| | | | Is it a requirement | neither the nationality of his or | might be the case when the parents are | 1102/2017, Plovdiv Administrative Court |
| | | | that the parents | her parents nor that of the | stateless, but also the case when the parents' | |
| | | | are also stateless | State of his or her birth; it is | country of citizenship applies only jus soli | |
| PRS | 1 | С | for the child to | not an inquiry into whether a | (that is, if the child is not born in the country | |
| 1113 | _ | | acquire the | child's parents are stateless. | of his/her parents, the child does not receive | |
| | | | nationality of the | ENS (2015), No Child Should Be | their citizenship). | |
| | | | host state? | Stateless: Only allowing access | | |
| | | | | to nationality for stateless | | |
| | | | | children whose parents are | | |
| | | | | stateless fails to account for | | |
| | | | | the circumstance where the | | |
| | | | | child's parent(s) do hold a | | |

| | | | | nationality themselves, but are unable to pass this on UNHCR Guidelines on Statelessness #4 2012: A | Yes. Children are required to prove that they do not acquire another citizenship by origin. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 10 & Article 11, |
|-----|---|---|---|---|---|--|
| PRS | 1 | d | Are children born stateless required to prove they cannot access another nationality to acquire nationality of the country of birth? If yes, please describe the requirement e.g. what is the standard and burden of proof, and how this is determined in practice? | Contracting State to the 1961 Convention cannot avoid the obligations to grant its nationality to a person who would otherwise be statelessbased on its own interpretation of another State's nationality laws where this conflicts with the interpretation applied by the State concerned the burden of proof must be shared between the claimant and the authorities decision makers need to take into account Articles 3 and 7 of the CRC and adopt an appropriate standard of proof Special procedural considerations to address the acute challenges faced by children in communicating basic facts with respect to their nationality are to be respected. | However, the standard and the burden of proof is not established in the law. The Plovdiv Administrative Court ruled that the submission of notarised statements by the parents that the child did not acquire any other nationality was not sufficient proof. The Court accepted that the notarised statements did not show that in the countries of the child's parents the legislation did not provide for the acquisition of nationality when the child was born abroad. | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) Judgement No 1424 of 04.08.2017, case No 1102/2017, Plovdiv Administrative Court, http://www.admspv.bg/spravki/dela/SD/0161d 817/10262017.htm (B) |

| | | | | UN Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, 1961: A Contracting State may make the grant of its | The Plovdiv Administrative Court ruled that the Law on Bulgarian Citizenship is in compliance with the European Convention on Nationality (to which Bulgaria is state party). | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 14, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) Judgement No 1424 of 04.08.2017, case No |
|-----|---|---|---|--|--|---|
| PRS | 1 | е | Is a stateless child born on the territory required to fulfil a period of residence to be granted nationality? If yes, what is it? Must this be legal and/or permanent residence? | nationalitysubject to one or more of the following conditions:b) that the person concerned has habitually resided in the territory for such periodnot exceeding five years immediately preceding the application nor ten years in all. UNHCR Guidelines on Statelessness #4 2012: States may stipulate that an individual who would otherwise be stateless born in its territory fulfils a period of "habitual residence". This period is not to exceed five years immediately preceding an application nor ten years in allThe term "habitual residence" isto be understood as stable, factual residence. It does not imply a legal or formal residence requirement. Convention on the Rights of the Child 1989: Arts 3 & 7 Committee on the Rights of the Child, Concluding observations on the 4th periodic report of the Netherlands CRC/C/NDL/CO/4, 2015: The Committee recommends that | So, if the child was born on the territory of Bulgaria and he/she didn't acquire any other citizenship by origin, the child should be considered as a Bulgarian citizen ex lege. In that case the child is not required to fulfil a period of residence to be granted nationality. | 1102 / 2017, Plovdiv Administrative Court, http://www.admspv.bg/spravki/dela/SD/0161d 817/10262017.htm (B) |

| | | | | | the State party ensure that all stateless children born in its territory, irrespective of residency status, have access to citizenship without any conditions. European Convention on Nationality, 1997: Article 6 (2)(b) Such an application may be made subject to the lawful and habitual residence on its territory for a period not exceeding five years | | |
|-----|---|---|---|---|---|--|---|
| PRS | 1 | f | a stat requi perio resid child grant natio what this b and/o | the parents of ateless child uired to fulfil a fod of dence for the d to be inted onality? If yes, at is it? Must be legal /or permanent dence? | Committee on the Rights of the Child, Concluding Observations Czech Republic CRC/C/CZE/CO/3-4, 2011: The outcome of an applicationby the parents of a child born on the territory should not prejudice the right of the child to acquire the nationality of the State ENS (2015), No Child Should Be Stateless: Demanding that the child or his/her parents reside lawfully on the territory is prohibited by the 1961 Convention | In the case of stateless children who acquire Bulgarian citizenship by birth on Bulgarian territory, the parents are not required to fulfil a period of residence. Otherwise, in cases of children who are not born stateless in Bulgaria, the general rule is that children acquire Bulgarian citizenship if their parents have acquired Bulgarian citizenship. If one of their parents is deceased, only the living parent must acquire Bulgarian citizenship. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 17, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |
| PRS | 1 | g | limits maki appli natio state born | at are the age ts, if any, for king an lication for conality for a | UN Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, 1961: A Contracting State may make the grant of its nationalitysubject to one or more of the following conditions: (a) that the application is lodged during a period | There are no age or time limits to acquire Bulgarian citizenship by place of birth according to Article 10 of the Law on Bulgarian Citizenship. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Articles 10 & 11, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |

| | | | | beginning not later than at the | | |
|------|---|----|--------------------|-----------------------------------|-----|---|
| | | | | age of 18 years and ending not | | |
| | | | | earlier than at the age of 21 | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | years UNHCR Guidelines on | | |
| | | | | | | |
| | | | | Statelessness #4 2012: | | |
| | | | | Contracting Statesneed to | | |
| | | | | accept applications lodged at a | | |
| | | | | time beginning not later than | | |
| | | | | the age of 18 and ending not | | |
| | | | | earlier than the age of 21 | | |
| | | | | ENS (2015), No Child Should Be | | |
| | | | | Stateless:any application | | |
| | | | | procedure which only becomes | | |
| | | | | available in late childhood or | | |
| | | | | even upon reaching majority is | | |
| | | | | particularly problematic [] | | |
| | | | | closing the window of | | |
| | | | | opportunity to apply for a | | |
| | | | | nationality has the effect of | | |
| | | | | leaving it in the hands of | | |
| | | | | parents to take the necessary | | |
| | | | | steps to secure a nationality for | | |
| | | | | their child | | |
| | | | | <u>UNHCR Guidelines on</u> | No. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, |
| | | | | Statelessness #4 2012: Some | | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |
| | | | | children are born to refugee | | |
| | | | Are there specific | parents who are themselves | | |
| | | | provisions for the | stateless or cannot acquire the | | |
| | | | nationality of | nationality of their parents | | |
| PRS | 1 | h | children born to | owing to restrictions on | | |
| FIVS | 1 | '' | beneficiaries of | transmission of nationality to | | |
| | | | international | children born abroad. Where | | |
| | | | protection? | the nationality of the parents | | |
| | | | protection: | can be acquired through a | | |
| | | | | registration or other | | |
| | | | | procedure, this will be | | |
| | | | | impossible owing to the very | | |

| | | | | | nature of refugee status which precludes refugee parents from contacting their consular authorities. | | |
|-----|---|---|------------|---|--|---|---|
| PRS | 2 | а | Foundlings | Are foundlings granted citizenship by law? If it's not automatic, is there an application procedure? | UN Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, 1961: A foundling found in the territory of a Contracting State shall, in the absence of proof to the contrary, be considered to have been born within that territory of parents possessing the nationality of that State. European Convention on Nationality, 1997: Each State Party shall provide in its internal law for its nationality to be acquired ex lege by the following persons: [] b) foundlings found in its territory who would otherwise be stateless. | Yes. A child found on the territory of Bulgaria, whose parents are unknown, is assumed to have been born on the territory of the Republic of Bulgaria. Thus, foundlings are granted Bulgarian citizenship by law. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 11, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |
| PRS | 2 | b | | If yes, is there an age limit (or status e.g. 'newborn') specified for foundlings to be granted citizenship? If not, when would a child usually | UNHCR Guidelines on Statelessness #4 2012: At a minimum, the safeguard is to apply to all young children who are not yet able to communicate accurately information pertaining to the identity of their parents or their place of birth | No, there are no such age or time limits provided in the law. The child would qualify when he/she is found on the territory of the Republic of Bulgaria and it is established that his/her parents are unknown. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 11, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |

| | | | 1 | 1 | | | |
|-----|---|---|----------|---------------------|-----------------------------------|---|---|
| | | | | qualify in | | | |
| | | | | practice? | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | Can citizenship be | UNHCR Guidelines on | No. Bulgarian citizenship can be withdrawn | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 22 |
| | | | | withdrawn from | Statelessness #4 2012: | only in cases of naturalisation. Foundlings are | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |
| | | | | foundlings if | Nationality acquired by | considered to be Bulgarian citizens by birth. | |
| PRS | 2 | С | | parents are | foundlings may only be lost if | | |
| | | | | identified even if | it is proven that the child | | |
| | | | | this leads to | concerned possesses another | | |
| | | | | statelessness? | State's nationality. | | |
| | | | | | UN Convention on the | No. The general rule is that the adoption does | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 6, |
| | | | | | Reduction of Statelessness, | not change the nationality of the adopted | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |
| | | | | | 1961: If the law of a | person. | () |
| | | | | | Contracting State entails loss of | F | |
| | | | | | nationality as a consequence of | | |
| | | | | | any change in the personal | | |
| | | | | | status of a person such | | |
| | | | | Where a child | asadoption, such loss shall be | | |
| | | | | national is | conditional upon possession or | | |
| | | | | adopted by | acquisition of another | | |
| | | | | foreign parent(s), | nationality. | | |
| PRS | 3 | а | Adoption | does the child lose | ENS (2015), No Child Should Be | | |
| | | " | Adoption | their original | Stateless:the "sending" state | | |
| | | | | nationality before | in a situation of inter-country | | |
| | | | | the new | adoption may be a non- | | |
| | | | | nationality is | European one, so even if | | |
| | | | | acquired? | Europe's nationality laws were | | |
| | | | | | all in alignment with | | |
| | | | | | international standards, | | |
| | | | | | children may be exposed to a | | |
| | | | | | (temporary) risk of | | |
| | | | i | | (55,55) | | |
| | | | | | statelessness during the | | |

| PRS | 3 | b | | Does a foreign child adopted by national parents acquire nationality? Is there a risk of statelessness during the adoption process? Are there any age limits? | European Convention on Nationality, 1997: Each State Party shall facilitate in its internal law the acquisition of its nationality for the following persons:d) children adopted by one of its nationals Committee on the Rights of the Child, Concluding Observations: Switzerland, CRC/C/CHE/CO/2-04, 2015:ensure that a child adopted from abroad is not stateless or discriminated against during the waiting period betweenarrivaland formal adoption. | The general rule is that adoption does not change the nationality of the adopted person. A foreign child adopted by national parents can submit an application for Bulgarian citizenship in case of full adoption. The child is exempted from the general requirements for naturalisation. Children under 14 can become Bulgarian citizens upon the written consent of the adoptive parents (or of the surviving adoptive parent). Consent by a parent who has lost his/her parental rights shall not be required. Under the same conditions, children from 14 to 18 years of age can acquire Bulgarian citizenship, if they apply for it. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 6 & Article 18(2), https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |
|-----|---|---|--|--|--|--|---|
| PRS | 4 | а | lus sanguinis and discriminati on | Can children born to nationals abroad acquire nationality by descent (ius sanguinis)? Are there any conditions? Are these conditions discriminatory? (see below if child would otherwise be stateless) | UN Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, 1961: Art 4 UNHCR Guidelines on Statelessness #4 2012:where a child who would otherwise be stateless is born in a Contracting State to parents of another Contracting State but does not acquire the nationality of the State of birth responsibility falls to the Contracting State of the parents to grant its nationality to the child Genovese v. Malta (ECtHR) Application No. 53124/09, 11 October 2011: the impact of denial of citizenship on the applicant's social identity was | Yes. A child is a Bulgarian citizen by origin, if at least one of his/her parents is a Bulgarian citizen. The Constitution states that: "A Bulgarian citizen shall be anyone born of at least one parent holding a Bulgarian citizenship". The only condition is to have at least one parent who is Bulgarian citizen. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 8, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) Constitution of the Republic of Bulgaria, Article 25(1), http://www.parliament.bg/en/const |

| | | | | | such as to bring it within the | | |
|-----|---|---|--------------|--------------------|---|---|--|
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | general scope and ambit of Article 8 the state must | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | ensure that the right is secured | | |
| | | | | | without discrimination | | |
| | | | | | Convention on the Elimination | | |
| | | | | | of all Forms of Discrimination | | |
| | | | | | Against Women, General | | |
| | | | | | recommendation No. 32 on the | | |
| | | | | | gender-related dimensions of | | |
| | | | | | refugee status, asylum, | | |
| | | | | | nationality and statelessness of | | |
| | | | | | women, November 2014 | | |
| | | | | | UNHCR Global Action Plan to | | |
| | | | | | End Statelessness 2014-24: | | |
| | | | | | Action 4 | | |
| | | | | | Fighting statelessness and | | |
| | | | | | discriminatory nationality law | | |
| | | | | | in Europe, Laura van Waas, | | |
| | | | | | <u>2012</u> | | |
| | | | | Can children born | <u>UNHCR Guidelines on</u> | Yes. A child is a Bulgarian citizen by origin, if | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 8, |
| | | | | to nationals | Statelessness #4 2012: | at least one of his/her parents is a Bulgarian | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |
| | | | | outside the | where children of a national of | citizen. The Constitution states that: "A | |
| | | | | country access | a Contracting State who would | Bulgarian citizen shall be anyone born of at | Constitution of the Republic of Bulgaria, Article |
| | | | | nationality by | otherwise be stateless are born | least one parent holding a Bulgarian | 25(1), http://www.parliament.bg/en/const |
| | | | | descent (ius | in a non-Contracting State | citizenship". The only condition is to have at | |
| PRS | 4 | b | | sanguinis) if they | the Contracting State of the | least one parent who is Bulgarian citizen. | |
| | | | | would otherwise | parents [is required] to grant | | |
| | | | | be stateless? Are | its nationality to the child (or | | |
| | | | | there any | children) of its nationals born | | |
| | | | | conditions? Are | abroad | | |
| | | | | these conditions | | | |
| | | | | discriminatory? | | | |
| | | | | Does the law | Convention on the Rights of | Yes. By law a birth certificate shall be | Law on Civil Registration, Article 42(1) & Article |
| | | | Access to | provide that all | the Child 1989: The child shall | issued within 7 days of the birth, on the basis | 45(1)(9), |
| PRS | 5 | а | birth | children are | be registered immediately | of a written notification by the competent | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134673409 (B) |
| | | | registration | registered | after birth and shall have the | medical entity. By law, the following data | |
| | | | | immediately upon | right from birth to a name | about the parents is recorded in the birth | |

| | Т | | | | |
|--|---|--------------------|------------------------------------|--|--|
| | | birth? Can | [and] the right to acquire a | certificate: names, date of birth, personal | |
| | | children be | nationality | identification number and citizenship. In | |
| | | registered if | International Covenant on Civil | practice, if the parents are undocumented, | |
| | | parents are | and Political Rights 1966: Art | they do not have a personal identification | |
| | | undocumented | 24(2) | number but only the date of birth is recorded. | |
| | | and/or not legally | Council of Europe, | | |
| | | residing in the | Recommendation CM/Rec | | |
| | | country (by law)? | (2009) 13 of the Committee of | | |
| | | | Ministers to member states on | | |
| | | | the nationality of children | | |
| | | | UNHCR Guidelines on | | |
| | | | Statelessness #4 2012: | | |
| | | | registration of the birth | | |
| | | | provides proof of descent and | | |
| | | | of place of birth and therefore | | |
| | | | underpins implementation of | | |
| | | | the 1961 ConventionArticle 7 | | |
| | | | CRCapplies irrespective of | | |
| | | | the nationality, statelessness | | |
| | | | or residence status of the | | |
| | | | parents. | | |
| | | | UNHCR Global Action Plan to | | |
| | | | End Statelessness 2014-24: | | |
| | | | Action 7 | | |
| | | | <u>UN Sustainable Development</u> | | |
| | | | <u>Goal 16</u> | | |
| | | | UN Human Rights Council, | | |
| | | | Resolution A/HRC/RES/20/4: | | |
| | | | ensure free birth registration, | | |
| | | | including free or low-fee late | | |
| | | | birth registration, for every | | |
| | | | childirrespective of his or her | | |
| | | | immigration status and that of | | |
| | | | his or her parents or family | | |
| | | | members | | |

| PRS | 5 | b | Are there credible reports to suggest that children are prevented from registering in practice because of parents' status? | As above | No, there are no such reports. | |
|-----|---|---|---|--|--|--|
| PRS | 5 | С | Are there mandatory reporting requirements for authorities which would deter undocumented parents coming forward to register their children (e.g. health authorities required to report undocumented migrants)? | UNICEF, Access to Civil, Economic and Social Rights for Children in the Context of Irregular Migration, 2012: While there is generally a separation between civil registries and immigration enforcement, undocumented parents may also fear detection, particularly in countries where civil servants have a duty to report undocumented migrants PICUM, Rights of Accompanied Children in an Irregular Situation, 2011: Certain barriers that prevent access to basic rights for children in an irregular migration situation arise across the registry, health, education and housing sectors. National legislation is oftencontradicted by other rules and practices, such as the duty to denounce | No. There are no such mandatory reporting requirements in law. However, the health authorities may decide to report to the authorities that the parents are undocumented migrants. | Law on Civil Registration, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134673409 (B) |

| PRS | 6 | а | Late Birth Registration | Is there a statutory deadline before which birth registration should be completed? If yes, what is it? Is late birth registration possible by law? | UNHCR Global Action Plan to End Statelessness 2014-24: Low levels of birth registration can be difficult to correct subsequently because procedures for late birth registration have not been established or are lengthy, costly and complex and therefore inaccessible UN Human Rights Council, Resolution A/HRC/RES/20/4 Council of Europe, Recommendation CM/Rec (2009) 13 of the Committee of Ministers to member states on the nationality of children ENS (2015), No Child Should Be Stateless: One of the ways in which states have sought to deal with an intergenerational lack of documentation is by simplifying the procedures for the late registration of births, making it easier for adults who do not have a birth certificate to acquire one, which can subsequently be used to register their own children's births | The law provides for a 7-day time limit from the date of the birth, but it rather concerns the obligation of the respective municipality to speedily issue a birth certificate upon the medical notification. Late birth registration is explicitly envisaged in the law (Article 44). If the birth becomes known to the municipality official within the same calendar year, the official shall issue a birth certificate without a need for a court judgement. If both the calendar year and 7 days following the date of the birth have elapsed, a birth certificate is issued only on the basis of a court judgment. The latter is stipulated upon the request of the parents, the person in question or the prosecutor. | Law on Civil Registration, Article 42(1) & Article 44, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134673409 (B) |
|-----|---|---|----------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| PRS | 6 | b | | Is late birth registration possible in practice? | As above | Yes. For example, in the case of a child born in Bulgaria to a stateless father and mother citizen of Belarus, the Sofia Regional Court ordered the competent authorities to carry out late birth registration and to issue a birth certificate to the child. The court ruled that in the birth certificate it shall be written that the child has Belorussian citizenship since the | Law on Civil Registration, Article 42(1) & Article 44, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134673409 (B) Judgement of the Sofia Regional Court of 07.03.2012, case No. 14912/2011 |

| PRS | 6 | С | | Are there any additional requirements (e.g. fee) for the late birth registration procedure? Are these problematic or do they cause lengthy delays? | UN Human Rights Council, Resolution A/HRC/RES/20/4 | child acquires this citizenship by origin in accordance with Article 10 of the Law on Bulgarian Citizenship. The only additional requirement might be the court case, which should be initiated either by the parents, the person in question or the prosecutor. | Law on Civil Registration, Article 42(1) & Article 44, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134673409 (B) Judgement of the Sofia Regional Court of 07.03.2012, case No. 14912/2011 |
|-----|---|---|-----------|---|---|---|---|
| PRS | 7 | а | Reduction | Does the government have any programmes in place to promote civil registration (including birth registration)? If yes, please provide details. | UNHCR Global Action Plan to End Statelessness 2014-24: Action 7 Council of Europe, 3rd European Conference on Nationality, 11-12 October 2004: Taken together Art 7 & 8 ECHR should be understood to encourage States Parties not only to take positive steps to avoid statelessness – including the promotion of birth registration – but also to grant citizenship to children who would otherwise be stateless | No. | |
| PRS | 7 | b | | Are there sections of the population believed to be stateless/at risk of statelessness? Are minorities disproportionately affected? Please provide details and source of information. | UN Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, 1961 Article 9 UNHCR Global Action Plan to End Statelessness 2014-24: Action 4 | In some cases, non-removable undocumented immigrants in Bulgaria for whom there is no regularisation mechanism are stateless or at risk of statelessness. | Foundation for Access to Rights - FAR and ENS, "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention in Bulgaria", p. 13, http://www.farbg.eu/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/1221 ENS Detention Reports Bulgaria 5.pdf |

| | | | | Has the | UN Convention on the | No. | |
|-----|---|---|-------------|----------------------|-------------------------------------|---|---|
| | | | | Government | Reduction of Statelessness, | INO. | |
| | | | | implemented any | 1961 | | |
| | | | | other measures | UNHCR Global Action Plan to | | |
| | | | | specifically aimed | End Statelessness 2014-24: | | |
| | | | | at reducing (risk | Action 1, Action 8 | | |
| | | | | of) statelessness? | UNHCR, Good Practices Paper - | | |
| | | | | (e.g. | Action 1: Resolving Existing | | |
| PRS | 7 | С | | identification, | Major Situations of | | |
| FNS | ′ | ١ | | registration or | Statelessness, 2015 | | |
| | | | | naturalisation | Statelessiless, 2013 | | |
| | | | | campaigns, | | | |
| | | | | removal of treaty | | | |
| | | | | reservations, | | | |
| | | | | reform of | | | |
| | | | | discriminatory | | | |
| | | | | laws, etc.) | | | |
| | | | | Are there any | UN Convention on the | Yes, in the Law on Bulgarian Citizenship there | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Articles 20–25, |
| | | | | provisions on loss | Reduction of Statelessness, | are provisions on release of Bulgarian | https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) |
| | | | | and/or | 1961: Article 8: A contracting | citizenship (Articles 20 and 21), revocation of | (-) |
| | | | | deprivation of | state shall not deprive a person | naturalisation (Articles 22 and 23) and | |
| | | | | nationality? If yes, | of its nationality if such | deprivation of Bulgarian citizenship (Articles | |
| | | | | are these | deprivation would render him | 24 and 25). According to the explicit wording | |
| | | | | established in | stateless. | in the law, revocation of naturalisation and | |
| | | | | law? If not, where | European Convention on | deprivation of citizenship is admissible, only | |
| DDG | | | Withdrawal | can they be | Nationality, 1997: Article 7(3): | provided that the person does not remain | |
| PRS | 8 | а | of | found? Do any | A State party may not provide | stateless. There are no loss/deprivation | |
| | | | nationality | loss/deprivation | in its internal law for the loss of | provisions that allow for statelessness. | |
| | | | | provisions allow | its nationalityif the person | | |
| | | | | for statelessness? | concerned would thereby | | |
| | | | | If there is a | become stateless | | |
| | | | | safeguard against | Universal Declaration of | | |
| | | | | statelessness, is it | Human Rights: Article 15(2) No | | |
| | | | | applied in | one shall be arbitrarily | | |
| | | | | practice? | deprived of his nationality | | |

| PRS | 8 | b | Who is the competent authority in any procedure for ordering deprivation of nationality? What procedural guarantees are there? (e.g. judicial oversight, time limit, subject to prior sentencing, appeal rights, legal aid) | UN Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, 1961: Article 8(4): A contracting state shall not exercise a power of deprivationexcept in accordance with the law, which shall provide forthe right to a fair hearing by a court or other independent body. European Convention on Nationality, 1997: Article 11: Each state party shall ensure that decisions relating to the acquisition, retention, loss, recovery or certification of its nationality contain reasons in writing | The competent authority in the procedures for release of Bulgarian citizenship, revocation of naturalisation and deprivation of citizenship is the President of the Republic of Bulgaria. The President has delegated these powers to the Vice-President of the Republic. A person cannot appeal in court the decree of the President/or the Vice President. | Law on Bulgarian Citizenship, Article 36, https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2134446592 (B) Administration of the President of the Republic of Bulgaria, Report on the Activity of the Commission for Bulgarian Citizenship and Bulgarians Abroad for the Period January 22, 2012 - January 18, 2017, p. 1, https://www.president.bg/docs/1484820446.pdf (B) |
|-----|---|---|---|---|--|---|
| PRS | 8 | C | Are withdrawal provisions (both for loss and deprivation) applied in practice? | | Yes. In the period from 22 January 2012 to 18 January 2017, the Vice President of the Republic of Bulgaria issued decrees for release from Bulgarian citizenship of 1062 persons and for revocation of naturalisation for 103 persons. | Administration of the President of the Republic of Bulgaria, Report on the Activity of the Commission for Bulgarian Citizenship and Bulgarians Abroad for the Period January 22, 2012 - January 18, 2017, p. 5, https://www.president.bg/docs/1484820446.p https://www.president.bg/docs/1484820446.p https://www.president.bg/docs/1484820446.p https://www.president.bg/docs/1484820446.p |

Jurisprudence and Training

| Cat | Q | Sub | Subtheme | Question | International Norms/Good Practice | Answer | Source |
|-----|---|-----|----------------------|--|--|---|--|
| ЦΤ | 1 | а | Published judgements | Number of published judgements adjudicating statelessness (broken down by level of jurisdiction). Please list. | | There are no statistics available. The courts in Bulgaria do not provide such data upon freedom of information requests. The courts in Bulgaria do not declare statelessness but have powers to review the lawfulness of the decisions of the Migration Directorate. The court has adjudicated on the competent authority to examine applications by stateless persons in the period when Bulgaria had acceded to the 1954 Convention but had not yet introduced a statelessness determination procedure in the national law. | Ruling No 843 of 22.01.2018, case No. 11998/2017, Supreme Administrative Court; Judgment No 668 of 6 February 2018, case No 8798/2016, Sofia City Administrative Court Foundation for Access to Rights – FAR and ENS, "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention in Bulgaria", p. 15, http://www.farbg.eu/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/1221_ENS_Detention_Reports_Bulgar, ia_5.pdf |
| ЦΙΤ | 1 | b | | Number of published judgements mentioning statelessness (broken down by level of jurisdiction). Please list. | | It is not possible to provide the exact number of published judgements mentioning statelessness. All judgements mentioning statelessness are not published in the professional paid legal information systems. They are published on the websites of the respective administrative courts, where in most cases one cannot search using key words. A search in the Judgements Portal delivers a technical error message. | Judgements Portal https://legalacts.justice.bg/ (B) |
| LIT | 2 | а | Legal training | Is there judicial training on statelessness? If yes, please provide details (e.g. provider, frequency). | UNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6): Officials who may be in contact with stateless persons need to be trained to identify potential applicants for statelessness status and refer them to appropriate channels. UNHCR Expert Meeting, Statelessness Determination | According to Art. 249(1)(2) of the Law on the Judicial System, the National Institute of Justice carries out maintenance and improvement of the qualification of judges. In reply to an inquiry made by FAR, the official response of the National Institute of Justice is that (translation from Bulgarian): "In connection with your letter of 21 May 2018 regarding gathering of information on | Law on the Judicial System, Article 246(1)(2), https://www.lex.bg/laws/ldoc/2135560660 (B) Response of the National Institute of Justice No. 32 – 00 – 261/1 of 23 May 2018 |

⁷¹

| | | <u>Procedures and the Status of</u> | conducting trainings for judges on the | |
|--|--|-------------------------------------|---|--|
| | | Stateless Persons 2010: It is | subjects of stateless persons and the | |
| | | recommended that States | statelessness determination procedure, | |
| | | provide specialised training on | adopted with the amendments of the Law | |
| | | nationality laws and practices, | on Foreign Nationals in the Republic of | |
| | | international standards and | Bulgaria, SG. 97 of 2016, we inform you the | |
| | | statelessness to officials | following: The above-mentioned topics are | |
| | | responsible for making | included in the trainings of the National | |
| | | statelessness determinations. | Institute of Justice on refugee law and the | |
| | | | implementation of the Law on Foreigners in | |
| | | | the Republic of Bulgaria. Since 2014 the | |
| | | | National Institute of Justice conducts | |
| | | | trainings jointly with the European Asylum | |
| | | | Support Office in pursuance of the EASO | |
| | | | Special Support Program signed between | |
| | | | the Ministry of the Interior of the Republic | |
| | | | of Bulgaria and EASO. The National Institute | |
| | | | of Justice is a beneficiary of this plan as an | |
| | | | institution training Bulgarian magistrates. | |
| | | | The trainings conducted have been | |
| | | | attended by 100 magistrates, court clerks | |
| | | | and experts, including 77 judges. The | |
| | | | teaching teams are composed of | |
| | | | international experts from the European | |
| | | | Asylum Support Office and judges from the | |
| | | | Supreme Administrative Court and the Sofia | |
| | | | City Administrative Court. The subject of | |
| | | | stateless persons is presented as a separate | |
| | | | module in the curriculum: Application of | |
| | | | Article 15 of the Directive 2011/95/EU of | |
| | | | the European Parliament and of the Council | |
| | | | of 13 December 2011 on standards for the | |
| | | | qualification of third-country nationals or | |
| | | | stateless persons as beneficiaries of | |
| | | | international protection, for a uniform | |
| | | | status for refugees or for persons eligible for | |
| | | | subsidiary protection, and for the content of | |

| | | | | | | the protection granted (Qualification Directive)." | |
|-----|---|---|------------|--|---|---|---|
| LIT | 2 | b | | Is there training for lawyers on statelessness? If yes, please describe. | UNHCR Expert Meeting, Statelessness Determination Procedures and the Status of Stateless Persons 2010: as above | According to the Law on the Bar, the Supreme Bar Council sets up a Training Centre for Lawyers to maintain and raise the qualifications of attorneys. In reply to an inquiry made by FAR, the Training Centre for Lawyers stated that no trainings on statelessness have been organised so far. In November 2016 FAR carried out a training on statelessness and prevention of arbitrary detention of stateless persons under a partnership agreement with ENS. | Law on the Bar, Article 28(1) https://www.lex.bg/index.php/laws/ldoc/21354 86731 (B) Response from the Training Center "Krastiu Tsonchev" to Request No C -345 (In Bulgarian: LJ - 345), received by e-mail on 25.05.2018. FAR, Resources: Stateless Persons, http://www.farbg.eu/en/resources/topics/stateless-persons/ |
| LIT | 3 | а | Pro Bono | Are there specialised lawyers, law firms or organisations providing free advice to stateless persons or those at risk of statelessness? If yes, please describe. | UNHCR (2014), Handbook on Protection of Stateless Persons: Applicants are to have access to legal counsel. UNHCR (Good Practices Paper 6): Gives the example of Liverpool Law Clinic providing legal assistance to stateless clients in the UK. | FAR, under a partnership agreement with ENS, provides legal aid to stateless persons in the SDP and in judicial review of decisions in the SDP. The partnership agreement concerns cases of strategic importance for social justice. The Bulgarian Helsinki Committee, through funding from UNHCR, also provides legal assistance and counselling, including to stateless persons and those at risk of statelessness. | |
| LIT | 4 | а | Literature | Is there domestic academic literature on statelessness? If possible, please list and provide references and hyperlinks (where available). | | A summary of the study conducted by FAR within the ENS project on protecting stateless persons from arbitrary detention was translated into Bulgarian language. Dr. Valeria Ilareva from FAR has published articles on the ENS blog. There are also several articles by Prof. Veselin Tsankov published in Bulgarian language. | Foundation for Access to Rights – FAR and ENS, "Protecting Stateless Persons from Arbitrary Detention in Bulgaria", http://www.farbg.eu/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/1221_ENS_Detention_ Summary in Bulgarian: http://www.farbg.eu/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/1221_ENS_Detention_ |

⁷³

| | | | | Reports Bulgaria BULGARIAN summary 2- |
|-------|---|---|--|---|
| | | | | 1.pdf (B) |
| | | | | |
| | | | | Article by Dr. Valeria Ilareva, ENS blog: "Bulgaria |
| | | | | is introducing a statelessness determination |
| | | | | procedure. Or is it?", September 2016 |
| | | | | Article by Dr. Valeria Ilareva, ENS blog: "Counting |
| | | | | down the days in detention: the situation of |
| | | | | stateless persons in Bulgaria", 18 November |
| | | | | 2016 |
| | | | | |
| | | | | Tsankov, Veselin Hristov, Stateless Persons in |
| | | | | the Republic of Bulgaria, Legal Aspects of the |
| | | | | Problem, 2006 - article published in the |
| | | | | magazine European Integration and Law (In |
| | | | | Bulgarian: Цанков, Веселин Христов, - |
| | | | | Лицата без гражданство в Република |
| | | | | България - правни аспекти на проблема , |
| | | | | 2006г. – статия в списание Европейска интеграция и право) |
| | | | | интеграции и правој |
| | | | | Prof. Dr Veselin Hristov Tsankov, Comparative |
| | | | | Analysis of the Possibilities of Accession to the |
| | | | | 1954 Convention of the Statute of Statelessness |
| | | | | and to the 1961 Convention on the Reduction of |
| | | | | Statelessness, 2011 – published in Legal |
| | | | | Collection (In Bulgarian: проф. д-р Веселин |
| | | | | Христов Цанков, Сравнителен анализ на |
| | | | | възможностите за присъединяване на |
| | | | | Република България към Конвенцията на ООН |
| | | | | за статута на лицата без гражданство от |
| | | | | 1954г. и към Конвенцията на ООН за намаляване на случаите на лица без |
| | | | | гражданство от 1961г., 2011, Юридически |
| | | | | сборник, |
| | | | | http://research.bfu.bg:8080/jspui/bitstream/12 |
| 1 | l | l | | ittp://researchista.bg.0000/jspai/bitstream/12 |

| | | | 3456789/406/1/BFU J T XVIII 2011 Tsankov.p df (B) |
|--|--|--|--|
| | | | Tsankov, Veselin Hristov, Stateless Persons in the Republic of Bulgaria, Actual Legal Aspects, 2014 - article published in a collection of reports from the Varna Free University (In Bulgarian: Цанков, Веселин Христов, Лицата без гражданство в Република България - актуални правни аспекти, включена в "Правото между традицията и модерността: сборник с доклади: научна конференция, проведена в рамките на Лятната научна сесия на Юридическия факултет, катедра "Правни |
| | | | науки" във Варненския свободен университет "Черноризец Храбър", 20 юни 2014 г" |